

Legislative Council

Tuesday, 31 May 1994

THE PRESIDENT (Hon Clive Griffiths) took the Chair at 3.30 pm, and read prayers.

MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT - SWEARING-IN

MacLean, Hon Iain Douglas

The Clerk of the Council produced and read the declaration of the Electoral Commissioner relating to the filling of a vacancy in the North Metropolitan Region consequent on the death of Hon R.G. Pike.

Hon Iain Douglas MacLean took and subscribed the Oath of Allegiance and signed the roll.

RULING - PRESIDENT

Bills, Introduction Options

THE PRESIDENT (Hon Clive Griffiths): On Thursday, 12 May, a member denied leave for the Government to introduce a Bill. I upheld the denial of leave, but indicated that I would review the circumstances and deliver a ruling at the next sitting. This is the next sitting.

I am satisfied that the member had the right to deny leave and that my decision upholding that right was correct. However, because of the existence of Standing Order No 221 and the procedure described in that order, I need to say something about the options open to any member seeking to introduce legislation. Until the changes made in 1989, the standing orders recognised two methods of introducing a Bill, each of which required leave. The Standing Orders Committee recommended, and the House agreed, that the use of a committee of members to draft and then seek leave to bring in a Bill was obsolete and could safely be taken out of the standing orders. The House also took the opportunity to insert what is now Standing Order No 221(a), which enables a member to introduce a Bill by notice of motion, without the necessity for leave. Had the Minister adopted that form, no question of leave would have arisen and the member would have been left with a decision of whether to divide the House on the question for the first reading. Instead, the Minister used a form of introduction in which he sought leave. In this context the granting of leave enables the Minister to introduce a Bill in a way that is different from that laid down in Standing Order No 221(a) as to the form of introduction. Both forms of introduction are equally valid; but one requires leave, the other does not.

AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORTS - No 2D OF 1994 ON GOVERNMENT PURCHASING, SUBSTITUTE INFORMATION TABLING

By leave, the President tabled certain substitute information concerning a table in a report by the Auditor General, No 2D of 1994, regarding government purchasing in Western Australia and tabled on 11 May 1994.

MOTION - URGENCY

Kyle Inquiry into City of Wanneroo

THE PRESIDENT (Hon Clive Griffiths): I have received the following letter -

The Hon Clive Griffiths MLC
President
Legislative Council

31 May 1994

Dear Mr President,

At today's sitting, it is my intention to move under SO 72 that the House, at its rising adjourn until 9.00 am on December 25 1994 for the purpose of discussing:

1. The failure of the Government to act upon the recommendations of the report of the Kyle Inquiry into the City of Wanneroo;
2. The failure of the police to find sufficient evidence to warrant a prosecution following complaints and information given to them in 1987 and 1988, regarding allegations of acts of official corruption by Dr Wayne Bradshaw and Mr David King, when the Kyle Inquiry was able to find the necessary evidence to warrant a prosecution;
3. The need for an urgent review of the police conduct of this investigation in 1987 and 1988, including a determination of which officers were involved and whether any of them had any connection with Dr Wayne Bradshaw and/or any other Wanneroo City councillor.

Yours sincerely

Alannah MacTiernan MLC

Honourable members, in order that this matter can be discussed, at least four members must indicate their support by standing in their places.

[At least four members rose in their places.]

HON A.J.G. MacTIERNAN (East Metropolitan) [3.46 pm]: I move -

That the House at its rising adjourn until 9.00 am on 25 December 1994.

As the first opposition speaker to get the call today, on behalf of the Opposition I take the opportunity to welcome Hon Iain MacLean to the House. I hope he enjoys his stay here.

Mr President, the issues we wish to discuss are very serious. They certainly cause considerable concern to the Opposition and we believe that they are of considerable concern to the community.

I will go through a few easy steps relating to the Kyle report: The Kyle report was commissioned by the Labor government at the end of 1991; its terms of reference were extended in June 1992; and the final report was handed down in December 1992. Members will be only too aware that was towards the end of the office of the Labor government. An election was declared shortly thereafter and a change of government occurred in February 1993. It was not possible in the space of less than two months for the Labor government to act upon the recommendations of the Kyle report. The new Government took office in February 1993 and by October of that year, some nine months later, no action had been taken by it on the many recommendations or on the more general findings of the report. This is not surprising as the report makes it very clear that the Wanneroo City Council at the relevant time and during the period which the investigation covered was very much a captive of the Moore division of the Liberal Party and that many of the major players of the dominant clique on the council were members of the Moore division of the Liberal Party. Dr Wayne Bradshaw had been closely connected with and a member of the Liberal Party for many years. The member for Wanneroo who was elected in February 1993 was also the subject of quite a number of adverse and/or uncomplimentary findings in the report. Certain comments were made on the conduct of Councillor Colin Edwardes, the husband of the Liberal Attorney General.

Point of Order

Hon PETER FOSS: It is discourteous to a member of this Parliament continually to mispronounce her name. The name is pronounced Edwardes and not Edwardes in the way the member has pronounced it.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: There is some confusion. I was not seeking to mispronounce the Attorney General's name. My understanding was that the pronunciation of the name of the then Councillor Edwardes was indeed as I pronounced it. I understand that is how his family pronounces his name. If I am wrong it is not designed to be discourteous. We understood that was the correct pronunciation. Perhaps we should seek clarification.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: He has told you that is wrong.

Hon Sam Piantadosi: How would you know?

The PRESIDENT: Order! Hon Peter Foss has brought to my attention a matter I assume he is raising as point of order. We have had a recent example of people determining how to pronounce the names of an electorate. Apparently some people thought it should be pronounced one way and others another way. I came to the conclusion then that when in Rome do as Romans do; that however people pronounce a name which belongs to them is the way to pronounce it. I am certainly not going to give a ruling on the pronunciation of a person's surname. It is not my role. You can call them what you like. As long as you do not use unparliamentary words, I have no problem with whatever you call them.

Debate Resumed

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Thank you, Mr President. I agree that with names one should use the pronunciation used by the person. I understood that the then councillor's family used the pronunciation that I used. However, I do not intend to allow the Government to sidetrack this important issue with a debate on pronunciation.

Hon Graham Edwards: It makes you wonder what they have to hide, doesn't it?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Yes. I will use a pronunciation which does not offend Mr Foss. In view of the very strong involvement of the Moore division of the Liberal Party in the affairs of the council, of the adverse and uncomplimentary findings relating to the member for Wanneroo and of some questionable findings about Mr Edwards, it was not surprising that the Government -

Hon Graham Edwards: Is that Graham or Colin?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Colin, of course. It would never be our illustrious Mr Edwards. It was not surprising that the Government hoped that the report would go away and that no action would be initiated. The report contained not only a series of recommendations but also a number of *prima facie* findings of corruption and breaches of various Acts - matters which clearly required further consideration by the Director of Public Prosecutions. When the Opposition found that the Government had been derelict in its duty, it took it upon itself to shoulder that responsibility and forwarded the report to the Director of Public Prosecutions. I understand that at least three of the transactions analysed in the report are now subject to scrutiny by the Director of Public Prosecutions.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: Is this the *prima facie* evidence of corruption that has been referred to?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: These are three transactions described in considerable detail in the report which are currently being investigated.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: If they are being investigated, does that make what you are about to say *sub judice*?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: No. We are not intending to go into the details of those transactions; we are merely pointing out that the Government failed for nine months to take any action on the serious evidence that was before it. It did not refer those matters to the Director of Public Prosecutions.

Hon John Halden: Not surprisingly.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: What happened for the first two months that you had the report?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: To be fair, it was two months before the election.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: But you did nothing; is that what you are saying?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: It would be unreasonable to expect a great deal to have occurred during those two months.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: Your government did nothing.

The PRESIDENT: Order!

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: We would not be arguing that the Government -

The PRESIDENT: Order! Order! The member will come to order when I call "Order!". Members constantly complain that one hour expires and members are only half way through dealing with the business before the Chamber. Yet they persist in ensuring that other members cannot complete their comments by putting forth a barrage of interjections. I am watching very closely for any breaches of the sub judice rule. If I think the member is contravening the sub judice rule, I will interrupt. In the meantime, everybody else should listen to what the member has to say so that we all know whether she is infringing the rule.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Thank you, Mr President. It was very different for a government in the last few months of the life of the Parliament not to have had an opportunity to properly analyse and digest the contents of the report and to take appropriate action. We are saying that nine months after the Government taking office, there had been no action and the matter had not been referred to the Director of Public Prosecutions. The prima facie findings in criminal proceedings were referred by the Opposition to the Director of Public Prosecutions and he has taken up those matters.

Since that time, a further seven or eight months have elapsed, which takes it one year and three months into the life of the Government, yet no progress has been made on any of the recommendations in the Kyle report - recommendations which were designed to prevent the scandalous affairs set out in that report from occurring again. No action was taken on serious allegations of criminal events until the Opposition acted, and a further six or seven months later no action has been taken on any of the recommendations that would seek to address the concerns. Yesterday, we saw a conviction on a matter raised in the Kyle report. That is clear evidence that the allegations have some substance and a clear indication that recommendations of the Kyle report should be implemented to prevent that sort of thing recurring.

The first recommendation which was of great concern and well within the Government's province to have acted on by now relates to the size of the City of Wanneroo. At the time the report was compiled, Wanneroo's population was 180 000. It was predicted that by the year 2001 its population would be in excess of 300 000. Its population is already in excess of 200 000. Commissioner Kyle found that the size of the council was a real impediment to any accountability of the council; that it imposed a workload and responsibility which was clearly not capable of being discharged by volunteer labour. Wards contain 65 000 people, which is the size of a federal electorate, which has a full time federal parliamentarian with three full time staff and is resourced by an office and has all sorts of expenses and equipment provided.

This Government is expecting three volunteers to discharge obligations to 65 000 people in a volunteer capacity without any secretarial assistance and minimal assistance with expenses. The councillors gave evidence that in excess of 40 hours a week need to be spent on council. This ridiculously onerous situation vastly reduces the pool of people that can be called upon to be Wanneroo City councillors. It made it easier for a small group of councillors to place on council people who were friendly to their point of view, made the council open to manipulation and made it much more difficult for councillors to give proper consideration to the matters before us today. A few people were able to have inordinate power and influence in decision making. That can be seen to be a major contributor to the scandalous affairs that have been uncovered here. The stories of corruption, of breach of pecuniary interest, of activities in gaining donations to council re-elections are quite extraordinary. Commissioner Kyle's report states that any sense of community interest has long ceased to exist in the City of Wanneroo. He also states that the scale and size of the municipality has destroyed any capacity for the ordinary citizen to relate to that entity.

Hon Sam Piantadosi: It appears that we do not have a quorum.

The PRESIDENT: When a quorum is called members must retain their seats. Members cannot move out of their seats when a quorum is called, particularly the person who called for the quorum.

[Quorum formed.]

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: It is understandable that government members need to be dragged in screaming to listen to this debate because it must be a matter of great embarrassment to them.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: Your own colleagues were not even in the House.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: Yes, they were.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: We have this very strong recommendation from Commissioner Kyle that the size of the City of Wanneroo makes the whole operation of its local government authority unsustainable. The recommendation is that at the first opportunity the city be divided into two or more separate municipalities. Do we get any action on this? Do we get any action to restore community interest to an authority that clearly is in major trouble, an authority that has very serious allegations of criminal conduct by its councillors confirmed or at least given support by the substantive findings of the Kyle inquiry? We have no action. What we have is the quite efficient and well operating City of Perth, which is a city of some 87 000 people, divided into four tiny towns.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: Tiny towns are in the top 10 per cent of the state.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Not in terms of metropolitan councils, which is the appropriate analogy. It was argued passionately by the Government that a need existed for community interest. Commissioner Kyle has a long and distinguished career in local government and has been president of the Local Government Association. He finds that in the City of Wanneroo the whole concept of community interest and of identification with the municipality has been destroyed, yet the Government does not act because it is looking after the interests of the Moore division of the Liberal Party and of the members within this place who have been and are related to people who have been on the Wanneroo City Council.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: It was not initiated when the member's party was in government. The member never initiated anything, never referred anything to the Director of Public Prosecutions.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: The member obviously has difficulty understanding this. The report was delivered in December 1992. The then government could not possibly have acted on any of these recommendations during its remaining two months in office.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: The member had the report for two months and sat on it.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: It was impossible for the government to act on any of these recommendations, which would have taken some time to consider and to frame proper legislative responses.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: The member had the file and failed.

The PRESIDENT: Order!

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Nothing was done.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: Nothing was done, that is right, and the member should be ashamed of herself.

The PRESIDENT: Hon Ross Lightfoot will come to order otherwise he might find himself outside reading a book.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: That would be a great pity because we enjoy his contributions. We enjoy rereading them in *Hansard* as they lighten our hours.

To recap on this first issue of the motion, it is a disgrace that not only has nothing been done to act upon this recommendation to divide the municipality, but also that so much time and effort was put into the totally pointless and worthless exercise of dividing up the City of Perth when no calls had been made about that authority by any commission of inquiry, nor any allegations whatsoever of corruption. Concerns were raised by the Government's friends in the Building Owners and Managers Association and in the

Chamber of Commerce and Industry that they might be sharing some of their revenue with the hoi polloi in the suburbs, and that is the only motivation for the Government to have created the tiny towns. The Government's commitment to this concept of community interest is shown to be completely bogus by the failure to act in these very dire circumstances of the City of Wanneroo.

The second recommendation - and it is quite spectacular that it has been acted on - concerns amendments to the Town Planning Act that are designed to eliminate much of the opportunity for the corruption and the ambiguity relating to electoral donations. Commissioner Kyle recommended that the Government should amend town planning legislation to introduce a formal mechanism for consistent assessment of betterment or injurious effect arising out of planning decisions. Commissioner Kyle, having looked at these many scandalous incidents given in evidence, came to the conclusion that almost all the allegations relating to corruption were closely associated with planning matters and most of the larger campaign donations were made by property developers. This arises from the capacity which local authorities have to rezone land and to give discretionary approvals in relation to use under town planning schemes. These rezonings and discretionary approvals of changes in use can have quite substantial effects on land values, as was set out within the document. Many incidents of rezonings commenced by various parties were referred to in the report. Commissioner Kyle says there needs to be some mechanism for a formal assessment of windfall gain or betterment, and some uniform policy to determine an equitable contribution to adjoining owners or to the community as a whole. The current situation allows applicants to negotiate with councillors behind closed doors to arrive at decisions on rezonings and the pay-offs for those rezonings, whether by way of contribution to community facilities or some other burden imposed on the land rezoned, or by way of a contribution to the campaigns of those who are arguing for these rezonings and discretionary approvals. There needs to be some fetter on that power. That executive power has far too great a consequence in changing the value of property for it to continue to be determined in the way it is.

Commissioner Kyle has recommended that there be a legislative response by way of an amendment to the Town Planning and Development Act to implement a uniform system whereby policies are developed about betterment and injurious affection in relation to land, and that there be some process of accountability in terms of those sorts of decisions. No-one will pretend that can be readily implemented. It will certainly require considerable thought as to how to define such a legislative scheme, but the Government has made no progress in this matter whatsoever. It has commenced no consultation about how such a scheme might be implemented and how such very important protections can be put in place to stop this corruption within local government. In the current situation volunteers have enormous executive power to change the value of real estate and we effectively have little or no control over that process whatsoever. As the events behind yesterday's conviction show, clearly there are serious concerns and they are not just flights of fancy. Yesterday's incident has proved that serious acts of corruption are going on within local government.

I will not go through all the recommendations - I may not have the time as there is no guarantee that we shall be granted extra time in which to do so. However, it is recommended that amendments be made to the Local Government Act to put in place a greater regime of control over when councillors are entitled to vote. At the moment the only provisions in the Local Government Act in this connection relate to pecuniary interest. Only when pecuniary interest exists is a councillor disabled from participating in proceedings and voting. However, as Commissioner Kyle pointed out, on analysing the various transactions that took place, many of the problems could not be characterised as problems of pecuniary interest. There were larger problems of conflict of interest where that interest was not necessarily of a pecuniary nature. Commissioner Kyle argued that legislative changes should be made to the Local Government Act to prohibit participation in proceedings by councillors and officers when a conflict of interest occurs. The prohibition should not be limited to situations in which a pecuniary interest exists.

Commissioner Kyle also said there should be a code of conduct for councillors with

regard to issues that may not be described as conflicts of interest but where councillors should refrain from being involved in proceedings. This code of conduct should provide some guidance on how councillors carry out their duties. There was a particular instance described in the report. Indeed, some of these recommendations came from the instance relating to the Chichester reserve which involved then Councillor Edwardes, the husband of the Attorney General. There was no finding of impropriety. In the instance referred to, a set of lavatories was proposed to be erected on a recreation reserve opposite a property owned by the Attorney General and her husband. Apparently the council made a decision - certainly not a decision which was publicised - to move those lavatories to a position arguably more advantageous to the amenity of Councillor and Mrs Edwardes. While it was certainly the case that Councillor Edwardes did not speak or vote in any of the relevant council meetings, and thereby obeyed the requirements of the Local Government Act in respect of pecuniary interest, the inquiry concluded that he actively supported the change of location of the facilities on Chichester reserve and opposed all attempts to revert to the original proposal. There was nothing either illegal or improper about this activity. The law imposes no restriction on a councillor who declares a pecuniary interest, outside the scope of the formal meetings of the council and its committees. Nevertheless, Edwardes' active involvement in the decision making process, and in particular his activity during the debate on the issue at the April 1992 council meeting, while neither illegal nor improper, was not conducive to the council being seen to be making an impartial decision on this issue.

That sort of activity displayed by Councillor Edwardes, who obeyed the strict letter but not the spirit of the law, led Commissioner Kyle to call for a code of conduct which would include a provision that councillors who have a conflict of interest in a matter before the council should play absolutely no part in the decision making process, either formal or informal, and should absent themselves from council and committee meetings at the time the matter is discussed. That is another very important provision that has been recommended by Commissioner Kyle to improve the standard of decision making and improve the faith of the community in the decisions made by and the integrity of local government generally, and particularly local government in the City of Wanneroo; and again, no action whatsoever has been taken to legislate for of that code of conduct, as far as we are aware.

I now raise some of the other issues mentioned in our letter to the President. We have expressed concern about the failure of the police to find sufficient evidence to warrant prosecution of the complaints and information given in 1987 and 1988 regarding allegations of acts of official corruption by Dr Wayne Bradshaw and Mr David King - information resulting in the matter being dealt with by the court yesterday. When it was first suggested to Mr Pavlinovich by Mr King that the success of his application for rezoning would depend on the payment of \$20 000, and that that money was to be paid into a certain account, Mr Pavlinovich in 1987 took that matter to the then mayor, Mr Cooper, and Mr Coffey, the chief executive officer of the City of Wanneroo. Quite properly, Mr Coffey called in the police to lay a complaint and have the allegation examined. The issue was again raised with the police in 1988 by Mr Bob Pearce, the then Minister for Planning. Mr Pavlinovich had gone to him, concerned that as a result of what had happened his application for rezoning had been withdrawn from the council and was not being considered. In the course of that discussion Mr Pearce was apprised of the full circumstances of the allegations and of the attempts to extract a bribe from Mr Pavlinovich. Mr Pearce wrote a letter to the Commissioner of Police and was visited by police officers in 1988. He was told that the police were not proceeding further with the case because there was insufficient evidence to warrant a prosecution. Yet in 1992, when the Kyle inquiry commenced, certain evidence freely came forward, evidence that showed a linkage between Harman Realty, a real estate agent, the office to which the \$20 000 bribe was to be paid, so Mr Pavlinovich decided to follow that course. In 1992, on some investigation, it became obvious that Ron Harman Realty was owned by Dr Bradshaw. Our concern is that it took the formation of the Kyle inquiry to establish that. Our concern is that it appears to us that the information could have been determined by the police officer handling the inquiry. These are not things about which we can make

confident assertions. Our concern is that there has been a pattern of allegation, contained in the Kyle report, that has suggested that there has been widespread concern that police officers may have been less than diligent in handling a series of allegations in relation to matters arising out of the dealings of the councillors of the City of Wanneroo. We are concerned that this may be just another example that perhaps this was a situation where a decision was made by officers at some level not to pursue a matter with due diligence. We cannot assert this confidently, but we believe sufficient concern exists to warrant this matter being investigated with the whole raft of matters currently being investigated and forming the basis of calls for an inquiry into the Police Force.

I refer members to a passage in the Kyle report where similar concerns are expressed. At page 7.8 it states -

These decisions by the Police not to prosecute any matter have led to further allegations on both sides that improper influence within the Police Department has stopped any prosecution.

The Inquiry has neither the power nor the resources to investigate those allegations further. It is in any event, in the view of the Inquiry, inappropriate for it to become involved in what would amount to an investigation into the Police Department. That may be appropriate for some other body.

We say this is a situation where we have the initial players involved in this matter, the matter relating to Mr King's conviction yesterday, players who had considerable influence via contacts within the Police Force at that time. We believe the community needs to be reassured that this was not an investigation that was nobbled - that those allegations made in 1987 clearly and firmly by Mr Pavlinovich, and repeated in 1988, were not basically swept under the carpet until 1992 when the Kyle inquiry commenced and was able to flush out in the early stages of the investigation the required material to provide corroboration for statements by Mr Pavlinovich in relation to his allegations, and which subsequently led to a conviction.

It is appropriate now for the Government to refer this matter perhaps to the Ombudsman. We do not have another independent body to investigate police conduct, and perhaps we could refer it to a select committee to look at the background of the investigation that took place in 1987-88 and to determine why that investigation was so unsuccessful in finding the evidence which seemed to fall so easily into the hands of Commissioner Kyle, enabling a case to be put together and a prosecution to be successfully made.

I turn now to a number of other issues including key recommendations of the Kyle report set out at pages 12.1 and 12.2. But first, a further matter of interest relates to the need to make more clear the forms on which one nominates for council positions. This issue arose from findings in relation to the member for Wanneroo. Allegations were made in relation to the way in which the member for Wanneroo had established his eligibility to stand for the Wanneroo City Council. He had listed on the nomination forms in the first instance in 1989 an address which at that stage did not exist. There was no residence at that address. Subsequently, premises were built, and although he appeared to be, to all intents and purposes, living elsewhere, he gave his address as 92 Dorchester Avenue, Warwick. The finding of the inquiry was that the evidence of Mr Smith and Ms Dawson, who was the owner of the units, was unconvincing in so far as it suggested there was any degree of permanence or regularity about Mr Smith's residence at 92A Dorchester Street, Warwick.

[Resolved, that the motion be continued.]

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: The inquiry found that basically the evidence of Mr Smith and Ms Dawson was unbelievable and the fact that Smith had claimed to be entitled to be on the electoral roll by virtue of living at the address in 1988 before units were constructed also suggests that Mr Smith's claim that he resided in the unit in the first half of 1990 was equally untrue. The report stated that the accuracy of electoral rolls and the truthfulness of people applying to be enrolled and the people nominating for election as local government councillors was essential to the integrity of the election process. It

argued that to ensure that there was no ambiguity there needed to be a revision of the form for application for enrolment on the electoral roll and on the form for nomination for election as councillor to make it clear that the applicant or nominee must state his actual place of residence. There is ambiguity now there, which, in this instance, was taken advantage of.

This report makes it clear that the view of Commissioner Kyle was that the member for Wanneroo has been untruthful. Likewise, in respect of the member for Wanneroo making similar statements about his address while enrolling on the state electoral roll, Commissioner Kyle found that Mr Smith was deliberately untruthful and that he acted in order to ensure his eligibility for election. He stated that although this meant that Mr Smith may have been guilty of an offence under the Electoral Act, it is an offence for which he cannot now be charged by virtue of there being a limitation of six months on prosecution. This fact makes it ironic that the member for Wanneroo has repeatedly claimed he got the all clear from the Kyle report, whereas the Kyle report is riddled with unfavourable findings in relation to Mr Smith's conduct in a whole raft of transactions that have been analysed therein. The recommendation and the concern of Commissioner Kyle was that there needs to be a considerable tightening up in terms of the enrolment forms, in particular, of the nomination forms for local government. That is not something that would be difficult to do, but we have seen absolutely no progress in that matter.

Hon B.K. Donaldson: Could you inform me exactly when that report was handed to the then Minister, David Smith?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: We have discussed this at length. It was handed down in December 1992.

Hon B.K. Donaldson: Could you check your facts?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: It was December 1992.

Hon B.K. Donaldson: It might have been handed in earlier. I would like you to be able to tell me.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: I understand that is indeed the date.

Hon T.G. Butler: You cannot expect her to do your research.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: December 1992 was the date. There may have been an earlier draft report, but there is no reference to any such draft report in this proposal and I would not have thought it was the type of report for which one would have a draft report. We are looking at a situation where the current Government has been in office for some 15 months and no progress has been made on those matters. I note in the Governor's opening speech that although there will be a whole range of other changes to legislation, nothing relates to these very crucial changes that are needed to the town planning legislation to stop the abuse of the executive power of local authorities. The Governor's speech contains nothing about modifications to the Local Government Act that were recommended in the Kyle report to ensure accountability, and nothing about the division of the City of Wanneroo which very much lies at the heart of the problems that have been outlined in the Kyle report. They are quite scandalous. On every reading of this report one is confounded by the degree of iniquity and the appalling conduct that was the order of the day in the City of Wanneroo.

Hon John Halden: Some are even proud of it.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: The issue of donations to councils was touched on earlier when we talked about the need for amendments to the Town Planning and Development Act. That issue was seemingly of great concern to the Government when donations were being received by what is now the Opposition, but now, as the Government, such donations appear to be the proper order of society and are to be expected because this Government is the proper upholder of the interests of business. Certainly Commissioner Kyle, a man well experienced in local government, was very concerned about the way in which donations were extracted, about the very nature of these donations and the

consequences they would have on subsequent decision making, given the extraordinary executive power and the power to affect property values that lies in the hands of volunteer councillors. At the very least, in addition to the changes to the Town Planning and Development Act that were recommended, there was a strong recommendation that each council should be required to maintain a register of pecuniary interests of councillors and officers. Again as far as I know this has not been acted upon by the Government. If we are to restore any integrity in local government, and if we are to maintain the confidence of the public in local government, these are the sorts of changes that must be made.

Mr Donaldson would be familiar with these sorts of issues, although perhaps in the smaller country shires these issues are less of a problem, but they certainly are very real and apparent problems in major metropolitan municipalities, especially those where there is a good deal of development going on.

Hon E.J. Charlton: There are a few problems in the City of Perth.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Absolutely, and these sorts of changes would be desirable not just for the City of Wanneroo but for the City of Perth and indeed for all local authorities.

Hon T.G. Butler: For the Shire of Tammin?

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: It would be very helpful for the Shire of Manjimup. The recommendation is that when a person makes a declaration of pecuniary interest they should be required to indicate the nature of interest that is declared. As it is now, when a declaration is made it could be a completely incidental, trivial pecuniary interest, or it might be that one has an interest as a member of say an adjoining tennis club to the property concerned, or it may be a major interest such as that of a principal shareholder of the company owning the land. There is no way of distinguishing which order of interest it is. It makes a mockery of declarations of pecuniary interests. It lulls people into a false sense of security as to what the pecuniary interest is because so many of those interests which are declared are totally trivial that one fails to be as alert as one should when there is a declaration of pecuniary interest. There is also a recommendation - I hope it will eventually be acted on - that the local government proposals for open committee meetings be implemented in a new Local Government Act. Again, Commissioner Kyle was very concerned that fundamental decisions were made behind closed doors at committee meetings where there was no capacity for the public to know how councillors were voting and what arguments were being mounted on either side. He said that open meetings would improve accountability and make the decision making processes of local government more transparent.

I think we have gone over most of the important recommendations. As I say, it is of great concern to the Opposition, although not surprising, that the Government has failed to act whatsoever. We have taken the matter to the Director of Public Prosecutions ourselves and those criminal matters are now being investigated. Nevertheless, it is up to the Government to dedicate resources to put in place these recommendations, particularly to divide the City of Wanneroo to make it a sustainable local authority and to restore the community of interest so close to the Government's heart.

Hon Peter Foss interjected.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: I am suggesting that councils of more than approximately 200 000 people and with a projected population within the next seven years of 300 000 go well beyond the boundaries of what should be considered local government.

Hon Peter Foss: You seem to be against it in principle.

Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN: Not at all. The Minister may recall that during the debate on the creation of the "tiny towns" the Opposition repeatedly said that research had shown there was some sort of optimum population for metropolitan councils of approximately 50 000. Somewhere between 50 000 and 80 000 people is our preferred size. We made specific reference to the need to reassess the boundaries of the cities of Stirling and Wanneroo. Our argument was entirely consistent with the line we are

putting here. We believe that local government should be accountable. We do not believe it is possible to manage on volunteer labour a city of 200 000 people with a projected population within seven short years of 300 000. It is not practical and is a complete nonsense for each councillor in one city to be responsible for 65 000 people - the size of a federal electorate - and for those councillors, who are volunteers without any support staff whatsoever, to be expected to run a constituency which is two to three times that of metropolitan state lower House electorates and probably about seven to eight times that of state lower House country electorates. It limits the field of people who can put themselves forward for office and it ensures that councillors are not capable of being on top of all the information required to make proper and informed decisions. That in itself has led to a situation where a few dominant and powerful individuals, arguably with vested interests, are able to extend extraordinary influence over the rest of the councillors. It was the quality of the decision making that led to the Kyle report and the scandals outlined therein.

The division of large electorates will directly affect the City of Wanneroo. The Opposition believes all the other recommendations that have obviously been made necessary by the Kyle report will benefit local government generally. The Opposition thinks it is a great pity that so much effort went into destroying the City of Perth local government, which was quite sustainable, while the real changes necessary to revamp authorities which needed it, and where Local Government Act changes were required to provide more accountable local authorities and to ensure integrity among councillors, have been totally ignored.

HON E.J. CHARLTON (Agricultural - Minister for Transport) [4.45 pm]: I am somewhat surprised that the member chose to use an urgency motion to bring forward this issue that has been on the agenda for a long time and has been outlined again by the member. However, that is her prerogative.

Hon John Halden: It is also the President's prerogative.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: I have been advised by the Minister for Local Government about the allegations and the questions that have been put forward by the member, with which I will deal first. The Kyle report contains a number of recommendations and the member outlined her displeasure at the fact that no action had been taken on those recommendations. First and foremost, when in government her party had a long time and a great deal of opportunity to change the Local Government Act. That action could have dealt with a range of the problems she has outlined. That did not happen.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: A wide and extensive consultancy process, not of the type your government is familiar with, had been commenced.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: The member's problem is that every time her government had an opportunity to amend the Local Government Act it could not, because it could not deliver the things receptive only to its philosophical point of view. That is why the Labor Party did not make any positive decisions about the wellbeing of the State; it was all about looking after the politics at the time.

Hon John Halden: You are not looking after your mates in Wanneroo?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: That is why the question remained unanswered when the Labor Party lost government. The other interesting point Hon Alannah MacTiernan finished on was that she wanted to see the City of Wanneroo divided into more than one shire. We will be waiting with bated breath for her formula on how that should be done.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: Give us some resources to do that and we will.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: The Opposition cannot work out which is the best way to do that! A person of her capability should be able to do that on her ear without any trouble.

Several members interjected.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT (Hon Barry House): Order! We cannot have three speeches at once; let us have one.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: In response to point 12.1 of the Kyle recommendations, a code of conduct, with no statutory basis, has been adopted by many councils in Western Australia. This was developed by the Western Australian Municipal Association and it is proposed that the new Local Government Act will require councils to adopt and regularly review a code of conduct for councillors and staff.

In response to recommendation 12.2, it is understood that the Bill to amend the Official Corruption Commission Act will clarify the application of the OCC to local government. Currently the OCC accepts complaints against local government, but its review role will be clearer under the new amendments.

In response to recommendation 12.3, the new Local Government Act will endeavour to clarify and strengthen the current provisions on pecuniary interests. There is currently no requirement for a conflict of interest to be declared other than one of a pecuniary nature. Any other such conflict need not be declared. That will also be addressed in the new Local Government Act.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: When will it happen?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: In point 12.4, the Kyle report recommended other aspects regarding pecuniary interests. Point 12.4 states -

The new Local Government Act will require a Register of Pecuniary Interests to be completed by all elected Members and designated senior officers of each Council.

Undertakings have been given that the scope and nature of such a Register will be no more onerous than that which applies to Members of Parliament. It is proposed that the Register be open to the public.

Point 12.5 states -

The new Local Government Act will require a complete declaration of the nature of an interest held by any Councillor or officer.

Point 12.6 states -

The application of provisions relating to the election donations is a complex matter and not easily applied to local government elections. Although final policy decisions in relation to this matter have not been taken it is likely that disclosure requirements would be triggered under the pecuniary interest provisions rather than under election disclosure provisions.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: When are we getting all these goodies?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: I said at the outset that this is part of the new Local Government Act which the former government failed to deliver. When we came into government we had to start again and undo all the fallacies that the former government tried to put into the Local Government Act.

Hon John Halden: For how long are you going to run that line?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Mr Halden had 10 years in government but did not get anything done. All the former government could do was rip off the state for a couple of billion dollars.

Several members interjected.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT (Hon Barry House): Order!

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: This is a little sidekick from the Opposition to get the public opinion redirected so it can take away attention from the scurrilous things it was involved in for 10 years.

Hon John Halden: Is this a little example of your scurrilousness?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: The member asked what was being done and I am reading from a written explanation from the Minister for Planning to answer that. If Hon John Halden does not want to listen, that is fine by me.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: We would just like to know when it is going to happen.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: When the Government brings the Bill into Parliament members opposite will know all about it. We will even give them time to debate the legislation. Hon Alannah MacTiernan will lead the charge because none of the other blokes would know anything about local government. The whole responsibility will be on her shoulders because she is the only one with the capacity on that side of the House to do it.

Hon John Halden: "Whip to George; he's in trouble again!"

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Order!

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Point 12.7 states -

The Town Planning and Development Act 1928 currently has a limited form of betterment provision which is not easily applied. Similarly although injurious affection is provided for both elements were criticised by Kyle for their inadequacies.

The Minister for Planning will have regard for this recommendation and is preparing new planning legislation. Point 12.8 states -

The new Local Government Act will reflect the proposals in the original discussion paper regarding open committee meetings.

Point 12.9 states -

In 1993 I indicated a willingness to amend the Regulations in accord with Mr Kyle's recommendation. The Department of Local Government subsequently advised that the proposed amendment to the Regulations does not appear to come within the scope of section 85 of the Local Government Act. Under that section a returning officer is only allowed to reject a nomination where a candidate's name is not on the electoral roll, the person is already a candidate for another election or certain procedural requirements have not been met. The Act does not allow the returning officer to question a person's residential or other property entitlement, and therefore any further information about "qualification" address would not be warranted.

A range of other recommendations are made, but I will not read them. If the member is interested the Minister or I will ensure that she is aware of the action which has occurred to date. The member also referred to the lack of action by the Police Department and questioned its association with a number of people in Wanneroo. The Minister for Police has just made available to me an update on the situation to clarify that point. It may not be acceptable to the member, but it is the situation. As the member knows, Carmen Lawrence when Leader of the Opposition referred the Kyle report on 22 October 1993 to the Director of Public Prosecutions. The DPP read and considered the report, and referred it to the police. The DPP informed the Leader of the Opposition that the police were already investigating the matter. Ongoing investigations are now being conducted by the Police Department fraud squad in consultation with the DPP.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: They have already taken place; there was a conviction yesterday in court.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: That is right; there has been a conviction. Is that the only one in which the member is interested? Does she think that is where the matter starts and finishes?

Hon Sam Piantadosi: There are a few more in which we are interested.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: I am sure the Opposition is.

Several members interjected.

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Order!

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: The investigation is ongoing; it did not end yesterday.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: We knew there were at least three matters still being

investigated. Why in relation to the King matter was absolutely nothing done between 1988 and 1992?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: That is a good question.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: Have you a good answer?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: If the member asked her colleagues, because she was not here when all of this was going on, she would find out that this matter started in 1987 - or perhaps a long time before that. The Labor Party was in government for another four years after that, and nothing happened. Does the member know why? Nothing happened because that matter was not even a bit of back burning compared with the other bushfires that were raging out of control around the state at the time. That is why it is unbelievable that Hon Alannah MacTiernan raised something such as this in an urgency motion today.

The PRESIDENT: Order! The Minister is supposed to be addressing the Chair, not the honourable member.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: It is unbelievable that a member on the other side of the House has the gall - the same person who is running around trying to instigate other activities in the City of Perth against the will of the people in her area -

Several members interjected.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Members opposite should ask the people in Mt Lawley what they think of the activities of Hon Alannah MacTiernan.

Several members interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order! "Order" means stop talking, and that means the Minister too. If members are going to carry on with this constant barrage of interjections when I call order, I will take action. This place is starting to degenerate into a circus. I keep saying to members that they do not have to like what people say, and they certainly do not have to believe it, but while they are in the Chamber they must listen to it. If honourable members do not want to conform with that basic rule of this place, I suggest there are plenty of others who would love to be here.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: During the member's comments there were no interjections from this side of the House, although nobody agreed with the points she made. Now, when they do not want to hear the other side of the story that is the way members opposite respond.

Several members interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order! If members on the Opposition side of the Chamber are going to defy me, I will do something about getting rid of one or two of them. While I am in this Chair it makes no difference as far as I am concerned on which side of the House a member sits. If anybody is suggesting that I did not bring the honourable member who was interjecting on that side to order, he had better look at *Hansard*. I not only called him to order, but insisted that he obey my requirements. The same rule applies to every other member. I do not mind members interjecting when there is need for a sensible interjection, but a continuous uproar will not be acceptable. I am so angry about it that I have decided not to persist with this discussion and the debate will be adjourned until we have dealt with questions without notice.

[Questions without notice taken.]

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Unquestionably the Opposition believes the legal consequences that took place in court yesterday as a result of the activities of the City of Wanneroo, to which the member has referred, are about a whole series of situations that came about in 1980. As a consequence the previous government instigated the Kyle inquiry, which resulted in a number of recommendations. I have outlined to the House the response of the current Minister for Local Government to that report. There appears to be some consternation by the Opposition about when the amendments to the Local Government Act will come into this place. They will come in when consultations with local government authorities and other interested community groups have been completed, and

that process is near finalisation. In fact, a number of the recommendations in the Kyle report have already been acted on voluntarily through the Western Australian Municipal Association.

Nobody on this side of the House endorses the actions that took place in the council of the City of Wanneroo or in any other council. If accountability is not what it should have been in that or any other organisation, nobody will try to protect those sorts of activities. I remind the House that these actions did not happen this year or last year; they happened in 1987, 1988 and 1989 when the now opposition was in government. I will not respond by asking, "Why did you not do something about it at that time?" We do not know why the previous government did nothing.

Hon John Halden: The matter was referred to the DPP.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: That happened in 1993.

Hon John Halden: In 1987 and in 1988.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: That was with respect to the police; but the then Leader of the Opposition took this matter to the Director of Public Prosecutions in 1993.

Hon John Halden: We had no choice.

Hon Kim Chance: And in 1987.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: I expect that those opposite recognise that they were then in government. They are now saying that a whole range of things that are wrong in 1994 are the fault of this Government.

Hon John Halden: We are not saying that.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: I am also advised that the Opposition questioned the determination of the police to find out what was going on. I am advised that Detective Sergeant Neil Clarke, Detective Sergeant Roger Smart and Detective Senior Constable Brian Griffiths were the three officers involved in the investigations in 1987 and 1988. None of these officers had any connection whatsoever with Dr Wayne Bradshaw or the Wanneroo council.

I can only relate that that is the information that we in this Government have about the situation that occurred in the period to which the Opposition refers. If opposition members have different information, I am sure that the previous Minister for Police, who was in this Legislative Council, would have taken the necessary action to ensure that what the government of the day wanted to do would have occurred. Neither I, nor anybody else on this side of the Chamber, will give a kick by kick description of what happened in that period. We know what has happened since 1993 and are responsible for the action that has taken place in that time. We will respond to any question or motion that the Opposition wants to put, and will fully debate any action that this Government has taken. We do not know what happened about a whole range of things in the years of the previous government. No-one is in a better position to answer questions about those matters than members of the present Opposition.

As to the points that have been raised in this urgency motion, some actions have been taken voluntarily within local government and will be addressed more specifically in the new Local Government Act. I am sure that the member who moved the motion, with her experience in local government, would acknowledge that anybody in Western Australia would have wanted to see changes to the Local Government Act implemented before this. Nobody is content with the situation. It is right for everybody to question when the changes to the legislation will occur. All I can say is that I have been to a number of ward meetings around Western Australia where points of view and questions regarding the new determinations of the Local Government Act were raised. I can assure members of one thing: The new Local Government Act will not be the same as it would have been had the previous government got it into Parliament. It had a number of aspects with which local government authorities around the State did not agree. As a consequence it was right and proper that this Government took those concerns into consideration.

As to the last part of the motion about the police, and as the member well knows, the matter is in the hands of the police and it is ongoing. If the member wants to instigate any further activity - to include the DPP or the Police Department - I and the Government would be interested in knowing what the member thinks should be done. Since we have come into government there has been no holding back about our trying to investigate the procedures that any proper law enforcement organisation, such as the Police Force, would want to have determined. The police action that has taken place has been publicly stated on a number of occasions. The Police Department can be no more criticised now than at the time those three officers were carrying out that investigation. That was many years ago. The actions taken have been for the right and proper reasons, whether for local government or the Police Department. There is a whole range of activities the Police Department are investigating in addition to those outlined in this urgency motion. Finally, if the member wants to pursue this in some form other than an urgency motion that is her prerogative. I find it surprising she has used an urgency motion which she will have to withdraw.

HON JOHN HALDEN (South Metropolitan - Leader of the Opposition) [5.41 pm]: It is amazing that we have the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Local Government and Minister for Police saying in a mealy mouthed way that this Government is doing something about the recommendations of the Kyle report. Hon Alannah MacTiernan has explained that is not the case. In respect of each of the controversial recommendations of the report this Government has in every way possible tried to play down the consequences and has not taken the action required. Let us examine what the Minister has said about the report and how he has played it down. Has he read the report? It is a damning indictment of Liberal Party members in our northern suburbs and of those members of the Liberal Party who encompass the Moore electorate area. In the same way that this Minister tries to play down the matter, the Attorney General, the first law officer of the state, tries to play down the matter when she says that it was not a damning report of the member for Wanneroo, Wayne Smith. The Attorney General ought to read the report again. It is page after page of damning indictments of the Liberal Party's activities in Wanneroo. I heard the new member's comments on "The 7.30 Report" where he said that he was proud to be a Liberal Party member on the City of Wanneroo, or words to that effect. The member ought to read the Kyle report before making those sorts of statements. He is yet to make his first speech in this case but those remarks may come home to haunt him.

The Kyle report will come home to haunt not only those Liberal Party members in the northern suburbs but also Liberal Party members of the Parliament in the northern suburbs and the odd Minister or two from there. It is unbelievable that the Minister for Transport should suggest in some lame way that the activities of those who represented the Liberal Party on that council are in some way the responsibility of the State Government of that time. That is more outrageous than most of the harebrained statements he makes in this place.

Hon Kim Chance: It is touch and go.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Yes, I may be going a little over the edge. In respect of the Kyle report there are questions to be answered. The community has a right to know the extent of reported and confirmed accusations in the Kyle report about political fund raising in the City of Wanneroo for Liberal Party members and candidates for the City of Wanneroo. We have a right to question who funded the campaigns of Wayne Smith, Cheryl Edwardes and the member for Whitford. Were they the same people who funded the campaign for Dr Bradshaw and Mr Cooper when they were candidates for Wanneroo in the previous election? There were also the efforts of Councillor King in seemingly getting people to fund his campaign at a time when he was a member of the Liberal Party in that area. It is incumbent on this Government, which came to power on openness and accountability, to present the financial records of who made which donations in the Wanneroo area. I may be proved wrong if the Government of the day presents the list, but I bet many of those people are probably the sorts referred to in this report, such as property developers who had seemingly close links with Liberal Party councillors in the northern suburbs.

To acquaint people with some of the activities up there and so as not to be referred to as talking off the top of my head, I will read from the report. I like reading this report because I like remembering the holier than thou speeches from those opposite 18 months ago of how corruption was something vested in the other side of the House. On the issue of the Woodvale Tavern it is alleged that Dr Bradshaw received a \$15 000 reward on or about 23 January 1989 from Rosinita Nominees Pty Ltd in return for assistance in obtaining council approval for the Woodvale Tavern and shopping centre. What did Dr Bradshaw say that he would do with that money from Rosinita Nominees Pty Ltd? He said that it was a donation for Brian Cooper, the then Liberal Party candidate for Wanneroo. In fairness to Mr Cooper he said that he did not receive a donation or ask for one. Knowing Brian Cooper that is probably the case. I know Wayne Bradshaw, and it probably is the case that he asked for the money. It was quite clear that Dr Bradshaw was on a little fundraising exercise for the Liberal Party using council by-laws and the planning process to achieve his ends. Let us look at chapter 3 of the report, which is a long chapter but delightful to read. I do not suppose those opposite will have read it because it will bring the odd tear to the eye. It states -

It is alleged that Dr Bradshaw received a reward from Richard Ah Boey Tay and/or Lobito Pty Ltd in return for support for applications for council approval in the matter of the development of the Belridge Medical Centre and Professional Offices, and that such reward constituted the sum of \$200 000 and the sum of \$50 000.

Not bad rewards. Of course one needs to read that in conjunction with the concluding remarks.

Hon Reg Davies: Did he accept those sums or did he have a bag man?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: He had them paid through Harman Real Estate Company and used Mr Harman to collect the money and pay it on some occasions into his brother's pharmacy, who was an agent for the Town and Country Bank, so that all the time the trail became more difficult. It was never paid in his name or into his account. The Kyle report was particularly talented in being able to trace where the money came from. The inquiry rejected Tay's evidence that the \$50 000 was a fee for work on a cosmetic clinic in Jakarta. That is almost as good as Eric Charlton's line. The payment was debited as an expense on the Lobito Unit Trust, whose only business was that of the development of the Belridge Medical Centre. While there is no direct evidence before the inquiry to connect the payment to Bradshaw's active support for the application for a pharmacy in the centre, the inquiry concludes that the payment was probably a reward for such support. There is no suggestion that the pharmacist was a party to the reward. It was the enhancement to the value of the centre which constituted an advantage for Lobito.

As to the \$200 000, the report states -

While the Inquiry has no specific evidence to connect the \$200 000 fee payable to R C Hemery and Associates and the proposal for the increase in gross lettable space, nevertheless the active involvement of Bradshaw in supporting that proposal on the Council and his clear involvement in the proposal for the fee leads us to the conclusion that the fee probably constituted a reward for Bradshaw for his support for the proposal before the Council.

The Government sat on that finding for 15 months. Yet the Minister for Transport and the Government want to blame us because we took no action in two months when we were basically in a caretaker role. This is the end to that. The evidence is there. Members opposite ought to cringe. I notice that the mouthpiece from the north has entered the Chamber. No member opposite has attempted to interject on what I have been saying because it is incriminating. For 15 months, they have basically done nothing.

This morning, I listened to a radio interview with Dr Bradshaw. I was surprised that, when he was asked whether the Director of Public Prosecutions had contacted him about bringing him back to this state or about taking evidence, his response was, "No." To be

fair, I acknowledge that Mr King pleaded guilty in the court only yesterday. However, the police have had that evidence for some time. They knew what Mr King was going to do. I am surprised that, with Mr King's admission, we still do not have action on the matter. It is time that those responsible, including the Attorney General, came forward and started to take some positive steps to dredge out the depth of corruption that obviously existed within the City of Wanneroo.

It is incumbent upon this Government, which was elected on a platform of openness and accountability, to come clean with its campaign records. It should tell us who donated to the campaigns of Cheryl Edwardes and Wayde Smith. Let us see if there is any connection, as there clearly was with Dr Bradshaw's efforts to get money for Mr Cooper. Let us see how far this goes. Does it go to the first law officer of the state? The first law officer should not be under a cloud. Who is a central figure in the report? The first law officer's husband. Who along with Bradshaw was a key player in the factional Liberal Party politics of the City of Wanneroo? The Attorney General's husband. We cannot have a situation in which for 15 or 16 months nothing is done.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: What did you do? You did nothing. You sat on it for two months when you were in government and did nothing about it.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: We were in a caretaker role. We sent it to the DPP.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Hon Ross Lightfoot may attempt to sidetrack some of our newer members by his inane interjections, but I will not be sidetracked down that alley. I will deal with the facts contained in the Kyle report.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: The facts are that you represented the most corrupt government in this nation's history.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: What is the member going to do about getting Bradshaw back?

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: I am not the DPP. I do not intend to do anything.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: The member should get the Attorney General to take action. This matter is starting to smell.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: It started to smell a long time ago.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: The central players in this are Liberal Party members in the northern suburbs and Liberal Party members who were involved in the City of Wanneroo.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: You are corrupt yourself.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: The member should do something, or his credibility will be zero. Because it may already be zero, he might earn a few points. This report contains page after page of indictment.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: You have only just discovered your own report.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I only decided to reread it today.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: It took you a long time.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I am delighted that I took the time to do it. It is the most rewarding document that I have read in a long time.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: Second only to Mr Lightfoot's speeches!

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I was amazed that in the other place today our shadow spokesman for police asked the Minister for Police, based on the admission yesterday, what he was going to do to further investigate the matter. He asked whether the police were going to carry out further investigations on Mr King's admission and on the outstanding matters in the Kyle report. This is a matter of significant local government corruption. The Minister's response was that he did not know. He had not taken the time to ask the Commissioner of Police or anybody in the Police Force.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: We could tell because we have taken the trouble to find out.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: We could tell. He did not know. The Minister for Police did not bother to find out about significant corruption. My goodness! He is the same as Eric Charlton, who is equally incompetent. He does not know about a matter of significant corruption. He has not spoken to the commissioner about getting the wheels moving a smidgin faster. At the moment, they are not moving at all. It is amazing that this situation could be countenanced by the crusaders for openness and accountability opposite. If this situation had occurred while we were in government 18 months ago, could anyone imagine that members opposite would have allowed the tardiness, absolute slackness and cover-up that have occurred in the last 15 or 16 months?

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: It occurred while you were in government.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Of course it did, and members opposite have had 15 or 16 months to do something about it.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: We investigated it. It was just before the election. We commissioned a report.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Hon Ross Lightfoot has interjected that we did nothing about it. Let us consider what the Government has done about it. It has done so little that after 11 months the Leader of the Opposition - not the Attorney General, the member for Kingsley out in Wanneroo - had to refer it to the DPP while the first law officer sat around doing whatever it was she was doing.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: Why did it take you that long?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: One would have assumed that, with this sort of report, the Attorney General would have done something.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: We presumed that it had been done.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: What evidence did you have to presume that it was being done?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: We assumed that good government practice would have been followed. I will not go down that stupid line because the member is just being silly. The Kyle report made a number of recommendations specifically related to the City of Wanneroo in terms of its administration, its size and those sorts of matters that do not need the Local Government Act to be rewritten. It requires a decision of government that there have been some problems. The Government may decide that the City of Wanneroo is too large and that it is now appropriate, based on the findings of the Kyle report, that the city be divided. It is a simple step. The Government did it with the City of Perth; it could do it with the City of Wanneroo. But nothing has been done.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: So you agree with our dividing Wanneroo, but it is different with Perth?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Nothing was done, despite the damning indictment of the City of Wanneroo.

Sitting suspended from 6.00 to 7.30 pm

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Before the sitting was suspended for dinner, I was commenting on the holier than thou brigade on the other side. I was using the Kyle report to make some assertions about the level of corruption and inactivity by this Government regarding the recommendations of the Kyle report. Based on the Kyle recommendations and on the admission of guilt yesterday by a former councillor of the City of Wanneroo, the Government needs to come up with a position which states what it is going to do regarding former and current councillors of the City of Wanneroo and various allegations that have been made. Before the suspension I was interjected upon by Hon Ross Lightfoot on a number of occasions. That is always a pleasant experience, as Hon Alannah MacTiernan stated, because it is always inane rubbish that he speaks. So inane was it on this occasion that I could not resist the opportunity to go to the *Hansard* of 1992, volume 6, dated 3 December. I will acquaint the House with some of the facts in this matter. It is perhaps something that Hon Ross Lightfoot might not want me to do and tries himself vainly never to do, but we will all benefit from my experiences of looking up *Hansard*.

When Hon Ross Lightfoot was in opposition he did nothing about this report. Hon Alannah MacTiernan endeavoured to defend the position of the then government, stating that the report was presented only two months before an election. The position is a little more succinct than that. The Kyle report was tabled in the Legislative Assembly at 6.21 am after the then Minister for Local Government received the report some 20 minutes earlier. This was on 4 December, but on the sitting day of 3 December 1993. The then Minister, David Smith, attempted to have the report tabled and printed. However, some consternation existed within the then opposition's ranks about the necessity of having the report printed.

Hon Kim Chance: I wonder why that would have been?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I have no idea why there was such consternation.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: It was the former government that was corrupt.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: Corruption is what we are discussing. Who is protecting whom and who is doing what to whom? The then opposition was so perplexed and incensed by the move to table this report and its findings which indicate corruption - some of which were proved yesterday - within the City of Wanneroo, that it took the step of dividing over whether the report should be printed.

Hon Kim Chance: They didn't want it printed.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: They did not want it printed. The 20 members present in that division who did not want it printed included luminaries within the Government ranks such as the now Hon C.J. Barnett, Hon C. Edwardes, Mr Bradshaw, Mr Omodei, Mr Lewis, Mr Kierath, and a number of other Government members. I will refer to the comments made in this House on that day regarding this matter. These remarks are illuminating and I will share them with the House. This is on page 8105 of that volume. I will quote the comments of the then Leader of the Opposition, the now Leader of the House. He stated -

In general, the inquiry has concluded that the overall reputation of the present council and administration of the city should not be tainted by the limited number of critical findings contained in the report. As I say, I have not read the report yet because it has only just been handed to me. However, I am pleased to see that the inquiry has at least concluded that there is no evidence of widespread impropriety or corruption in that council.

That is an interesting comment when the report had not been read. It is more about wishcraft than about the facts that are contained within this report. It is a report which I suggest to the now Leader of the House that he read because allegations of corruption are made involving many notable people in the Liberal Party at that time. I will continue -

Peter Kyle, a barrister and solicitor in Perth, was appointed by the Minister to conduct the inquiry and was granted the status of a commissioner. Given the number of people who have raised matters with me over a period concerning this inquiry, it is fair to say that Peter Kyle, a former member of the Liberal Party and former branch president of the Liberal Party, for reasons of his own, has decided to embark on a crusade to be critical of the Liberal Party.

We are going to shoot the messenger with the tactic of the day! He continues -

Members will recall that at one stage during the inquiry Kyle said that he believed that the City of Wanneroo was a breeding ground for Liberal politicians.

We would never have thought that!

The PRESIDENT: Order! Would you identify the page?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I already have. It is page 8105. He continues -

Whether that is true is a matter that can be established by the facts. However, I believe that Peter Kyle was used as a stooge by the Labor Party to conduct that inquiry to see whether he could get any dirt on current or former members of the council and to crucify the Liberal Party.

Hon A.J.G. MacTiernan: How does the Leader of the Government explain the conviction yesterday?

Hon JOHN HALDEN: How does he explain that he had not read the report and yet made those comments? It was clearly a matter of shooting the messenger. The then opposition had an idea of what was contained in the report and did not like it. He was then asked, "Have you read the report?" and again the then Leader of the Opposition replied, "I have not; I have just been handed it. Before I read the report I want to close my comments." We were pleased that he based all of these comments on facts. He was just taking a message from the Minister for Transport on how not to do it.

Hon Reg Davies: That was about 7.00 in the morning.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I am sure that is correct. It was on the Friday morning. One could make the excuse, as Hon Reg Davies suggested, that it was by virtue of tiredness that the then Leader of the Opposition decided that it was necessary and appropriate to shoot the commissioner - or was it the messenger?

It is clear that there has been corruption within the City of Wanneroo. It is clear that an enormous number of unanswered allegations have been made about corruption within the City of Wanneroo. It is clear, as Peter Kyle said, that the City of Wanneroo has been a training ground for Liberal Party politicians, perhaps not the best training ground but a training ground nonetheless. A number of questions need to be answered by the Government and various members in either this House or another place, so that this debate can be placed on a reasonable track, and the community can be convinced that no Government members have acted with impropriety in these matters. The sorts of questions that need to be answered and, of course, in the first instance asked are: Did the member for Kingsley receive any money or any kind of donation from any company or person named in the Kyle report? Did the member for Wanneroo receive any money or any kind of donation from any company or person named in the Kyle report?

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: He has already made a statement to that effect.

Hon JOHN HALDEN: I am asking the question again. Did the member for Whitford receive any money or any kind of donation from a company or person named in the Kyle report? Did the Liberal Party receive any money or in kind donation from a company or person named in the Kyle report? The experience with the \$15 000 donation sought by Dr Bradshaw for a then candidate for Wanneroo, Brian Cooper, suggests we cannot just take people's word in these matters. The community is starting to demand - there is a feeling that it is appropriate to do so - to see the records. We all keep financial records with regard to campaigning because it is an absolute necessity to do so. Woe betide anyone who does not keep records. He will do so at his peril because the community will demand to see those records. More questions must be answered in regard to this matter. Has the Attorney General taken advice from the Solicitor General or the Crown Solicitor in this matter in relation to her position? If not, why not? Will the Government request the Commonwealth Government's support for the extradition of Dr Bradshaw immediately? Will the Attorney General speak to her colleague, the Minister for Police, and the Government so that the necessary resources will be guaranteed to allow the fraud squad to pursue Dr Bradshaw and any other people that the police or the Director of Public Prosecutions may wish to investigate? Once those questions have been answered these matters will be clarified and the community will feel more at ease.

With regard to some of the more general administrative matters referred to in the Kyle report, it is not appropriate for a Minister to come into this Chamber in response to the serious matters that have been raised and to say that the Government is considering amendments to or a totally new Local Government Act. The people are demanding that the Government do something now. It has been in office for 16 months and has done little or nothing to instill in the public any confidence in the credibility of this Government. For the Government to send in probably its most junior and, to be blunt, one of its more incompetent Ministers to defend this grave matter of public concern, and for that Minister to read notes prepared by another Minister, of such brevity and in such a cavalier manner, does no justice to a matter which strikes at the very heart of public

accountability, if not at the state level, certainly at the local government level. It involves the largest local government authority in terms of population and the fastest growing local government area in Western Australia. This matter will not go away; I understand that police inquiries are continuing at the moment, and more and more concerns and doubts will be raised as time goes on. It is incumbent on the Government to advise people in regard to its dealings in these matters and it must be open and accountable. If it is not, at the end of the day this will be a bleeding sore that will not heal. It is now in the hands of the Government. The Government must be honest and accountable. These are the members with the holier than thou attitude who lectured the Parliament year after year about accountability and the evils of corruption. It is now in this Government's backyard and its members have been named. The Government must show the community that it is not just a government of words but is a government of action. If it does not do so, it will not be long before the pressures that some of us had to sustain in this place will be reversed. That is a delightful prospect to me. It is in the Government's hands to manage this appropriately. The Opposition will wait for the Government to take a position in this matter and I hope deal with it appropriately and in a reasonable way.

HON A.J.G. MacTIERNAN (East Metropolitan) [7.47 pm]: I am extremely grateful to Hon John Halden for his comments because he has shown in those very interesting readings from *Hansard* that the Government of today has always dealt with this report on the basis of bad faith. From the outset the Liberals had no intention of or commitment to addressing the problems raised in the Kyle report. They completely refused to acknowledge that unravelled in the Kyle report were allegations of substantial corruption, impropriety and criminal activity among certain key players in the City of Wanneroo. The Opposition brought forward this urgency motion because it believes that the findings yesterday when criminal charges were sustained against a former Wanneroo City councillor certainly demonstrate that the Kyle report was a report of substance. Those allegations were sustained in a court of law beyond all reasonable doubt. In view of that, we believe it has focused on the failure of the Government to act in any way in respect of the Kyle report. We have witnessed the appalling spectacle of the Government's failure to refer the matter to the Director of Public Prosecutions, and heard the silly interjections of Hon Ross Lightfoot that the previous government should have taken action in the two months it had remaining of its term when the report was released. We do not accept that. As Hon John Halden said, we believe we were in a caretaker role at that time, in the middle of an election campaign. It was a frivolous comment.

It is clear that the Government is extremely embarrassed by the involvement of prominent Liberal Party figures in the City of Wanneroo. I will address some of the responses by the Minister. I attempted to listen very carefully to his argument and I must say I could not find one substantial response to our concern about perhaps one of the principal recommendations of this report - that the City of Wanneroo be divided into two or more municipalities. Not one point was put forward to justify, and not one argument could be mustered by the Government to explain, its complete failure to address that issue. It was a complete failure, and it was made worse by the totally inappropriate action in relation to the City of Perth. It is important to understand that Commissioner Kyle found that it was absolutely crucial in getting the affairs of the Wanneroo City Council on a proper and accountable basis for the city to be divided. At that time the city's population was 180 000; it is now 200 000. As Commissioner Kyle said, we cannot have accountable government where we have only a small number of people who can effectively nominate for the council, and as the workload for the Wanneroo City Council seems to be in excess of 40 hours a week with constituencies the size of electorates, it is not possible for voluntary councillors to be properly informed, to properly acquaint themselves with matters on which they make decisions. It is this fact that has enabled the council to be dominated by a few persons who have powerful vested interests. It is crucial to implement this reform of the Wanneroo City Council. We do not have one argument raised by the Government to justify its complete failure to act in this regard.

I was pleased to hear the Minister for Transport say in relation to some other matters that

changes had been proposed to the Local Government Act and the Town Planning Act. The Minister said it was all in hand and eventually would come out in the new Local Government Act. I presume there are moves afoot to follow the excellent work started by the previous Labor government to revise the Act and create a new scheme for local government within the state, but that is a huge task. It is one that presumably will take at least another year - presuming the Government engages in a consultation process with local authorities. But it is not appropriate to refrain from any action in the interim. To give a case in point, while Labor was undertaking a substantial review of the Local Government Act, it became obvious around 1990 that there was considerable rotting of the postal voting system in local government elections. The government took upon itself there and then, without waiting for this overhaul of the Local Government Act, to tighten up procedures and to put on a better basis the rules regarding postal voting to ensure fraud within the system was made more difficult.

It is clear, not only from the Wanneroo City Council but also from other councils that have been subject to investigation over the last few years, that there are substantial problems of corruption within local government, and that strategies should be put in place to minimise that situation and to restore some integrity. As we have set out those recommendations there is no justification whatsoever to delay or defer them until a total overhaul of the Local Government Act takes place. What might have appeared to be one thing the Government would do turns out to be complete nonsense and a delaying tactic. Although we will be pursuing with considerable vigour these proposed changes to the Local Government Act and the Town Planning Act, interim changes should be made to put local government on a better footing. Simple measures, such as restructuring the nomination form to make clearer the position on eligibility to stand for council, should be addressed immediately. The declaration of pecuniary interest and the nature of it can be implemented immediately. Certainly we can readily devise a scheme for a register of pecuniary interest.

The Minister stated that a code of conduct has been put in place since the production of the Kyle report; in fact he said it was put in place voluntarily by the Western Australian Municipal Association. The fact is, a code of conduct had been established by WAMA and existed at the time of the Kyle report. He said that although it was useful it had no statutory recognition and backing. Mr Kyle said it was necessary for this to have effect, to have statutory entrenchment of a code of conduct and some provision for enforcement of the measures within the code. So even the one thing the Minister claimed had been done is nonsense. It was already in place and the Kyle report took that into account and said it was not enough; it needs statutory entrenchment. Unfortunately, the Minister made nonsensical comments about what had been done.

I am sure the Minister tried hard, but it is very evident that he failed totally to understand our next point relating to the investigation in 1987 into what one might call the Craigie roller rink affair which led to the conviction of former councillor King in the court yesterday. We say that by 1988 when a Labor Minister made an inquiry to the Commissioner of Police as to why prosecutions had not proceeded on this matter, he was advised by the police that there was insufficient information, notwithstanding a very clear statement by Mr Pavlinovich about this matter. They claimed there was no corroborating evidence, but we found shortly after the commencement of the Kyle inquiry that further information became easily discoverable. It was information showing a link between Harman Realty and Dr Bradshaw. Dr Bradshaw was the owner of Harman Realty. Our question was, if this matter was being properly dealt with by the police in 1988 why was this information not discovered? This was an operational matter which the Labor government at the time had no power to investigate. Inquiries had been made, and it was taken on face value that there was insufficient corroborating evidence. It was not until the Kyle report in 1992 that it became obvious that there had been other evidence, that there was evidence in existence, and that the Kyle inquiry had discovered it. It was not until that time one could properly ask the question, why did the police not find this evidence? So, two months before the election the Labor government found that information was available that would have corroborated the claims of Mr Pavlinovich.

That begs the question, why was this evidence not found by the police investigating the matter? This question must be asked in view of Dr Bradshaw's substantial linkage with members of the Police Force - and there is certainly more than one such contact - and the allegations found in the Kyle report that a whole range of matters related to the conduct of Wanneroo City councillors had not been investigated because these police contacts had been involved in that investigation at one level or another. We cannot assert categorically that this happened in relation to this inquiry. It could be that the best endeavours were made, and owing to lack of ability or resources the police were unable to uncover the evidence. In view of Dr Bradshaw's links with the police generally, in view of the seeming ease with which this evidence was discovered by Commissioner Kyle, in view of the allegations contained in the report of police nobbling other investigations, and in view of the fact that Mr Kyle said he could not investigate those allegations under his terms of reference, perhaps there should be an investigation by another body, in this instance a review of the reasons why this vital evidence was not discovered by the police.

The fact that the Director of Public Prosecutions is currently investigating other matters coming out of the Kyle report, and that the DPP is seemingly pursuing Dr Bradshaw in relation to this affair, is not the issue. We know that is being done and we are satisfied the DPP is discharging his duty in this regard. We are asking whether there is evidence that in 1987-88 this inquiry was nobbled. The importance now is whether there is in fact corruption or illegal conduct within the Police Force. We all know that there has been a great deal of concern within the community, certainly over the past six months, about the conduct generally of the police; and the integrity of the police has been brought into question. They are our points; there is a need to look at that issue of why this investigation stalled in 1987 only to be kick-started again by Kyle in 1992. There is a very urgent need for the Government to stand up to its responsibilities and start implementing some of the recommendations of the Kyle report. There is a need for the Government to be prepared to take on vested interests in the Wanneroo City Council and divide that council to form sustainable municipalities where there is commonality of interest and where the scale of that council makes it possible for the council to discharge its duties under the current structure of voluntary labour under the Local Government Act.

Finally, there is an obligation on the Government to start acting on some of the specific recommendations in relation to pecuniary interest in the Kyle report and also recommendations in relation to windfall profits and injurious affection in the town planning legislation. There is no justification for all of those issues to wait until there is a major overhaul of the local government legislation. If members believe local government must be sustainable, that the integrity of local government is important to the community, then action must be taken on all those matters, and taken immediately.

Motion, by leave, withdrawn.

TOTALISATOR AGENCY BOARD BETTING AMENDMENT BILL

Introduction and First Reading

Bill introduced, on motion by Hon George Cash (Leader of the House), and read a first time.

Second Reading

HON GEORGE CASH (North Metropolitan - Leader of the House) [8.04 pm]: I move -

That the Bill be now read a second time.

The purpose of this Bill is to amend sections 20(1) and 27 of the Totalisator Agency Board Betting Act. The amendments will allow the Western Australian TAB to continue to participate in the combined win and place betting pool SuperTAB when the Victorian TAB, a statutory authority, ceases to exist and its operations are taken over by the public company TABCORP. I understand that legislation to convert the Victorian TAB to the

public company TABCORP is presently before the Victorian Parliament and may be introduced from 1 August 1994. While there is some uncertainty about this date, to protect the interests of punters and the TAB the Government intends to proclaim the legislative changes well before this date. The TAB's participation in combined pools is limited to "any other state, or any territory or any authority". Once the Victorian legislation is proclaimed, the Western Australian TAB will have to withdraw from the SuperTAB if the Totalisator Agency Board Betting Act is not amended. The passing of the Bill will ensure that the TAB is able to continue to provide the combined betting pool service SuperTAB to Western Australian punters. Otherwise Western Australian punters would be disadvantaged by not being able to bet into the larger SuperTAB pool.

The amendments to the Act will enable the TAB to participate in combined betting pools operated by bodies corporate as prescribed in regulations. Parliament will, therefore, be able to review any arrangements for the TAB's participation in combined betting pools with public companies before any contracts are let. I commend the Bill to the House.

Debate adjourned, on motion by Hon T.G. Butler.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT - MINISTER FOR LANDS

Land Administration, Department of, Land Transactions Increase

HON GEORGE CASH (North Metropolitan - Minister for Lands) [8.06 pm] - by leave: Strong economic growth of the state's economy since this Government was elected is being evidenced by a significant 22 per cent growth in land transactions in the Department of Land Administration compared to the March quarter 1993. In this ministerial statement I propose to outline how DOLA is dealing with the increased volume of work and what action is being taken to ensure that land transactions are not delayed or held up and, further, that the planned reduction of 150 DOLA staff by June this year under the Government's public sector reform process has not directly contributed to delays in processing the significant growth in land transactions. Very clearly, this state is leading Australia in economic growth and the increased activity in real estate transactions is one of the indicators of that growth. DOLA has taken a number of actions to deal with processing the welcome level of increased land transactions.

Firstly, DOLA's relocation to Midland has been difficult because some client groups, namely the Settlement Agents Association, have not accepted the previous Labor government's decision to relocate DOLA to Midland. In seeking to overcome this transition I have made a concession to settlement agents and the conveyancing industry to retain a Perth branch office of DOLA to allow lodgment and return of land transaction documents in the city. DOLA achieved a very successful move of its total operation in August of last year without any disruption to land transaction processing. Secondly, searching of land title records by its client groups since the move has changed to the extent that 98 per cent of all search information is now delivered to clients in their own office by computerised systems and facsimile, while prior to the move 40 per cent of clients personally collected their searches. This is a remarkable shift in service delivery over a short period of time.

The Department of Land Administration staff and management should be congratulated on the way in which they have coped with this major change in delivery of searches. In addition, during the 1988-89 land boom, under the previous Labor government, each land title search was taking an average of six hours to deliver. DOLA's newly developed Register 2000 Autofax search service is currently delivering searches on average within 15 minutes. This service is recognised as one of the best services available in any Australian state. The significant increase of 22 per cent in land transactions, compared with the March quarter in 1993, is however, causing some delays in processing. I am advised that this level is greater than that experienced in the last land boom in 1988-89. At that time the average processing time to record a title transaction was taking 18 working days, compared with 15 working days during April this year. DOLA commenced a program of overtime in April to reduce average processing time to acceptable levels by July. DOLA acknowledges that overtime is not a long term solution

to coping with increased volumes of transactions. It has been actively researching and developing a number of initiatives to deal with the issue. These include -

The introduction of a group four facsimile search delivery system to speed up remote search services, which will provide four times as fast searching service for clients who opt to use this service;

developing a new automated method of recording land transactions on certificates of title, which is expected to improve productivity by mid 1995; and

DOLA has modified practices, in recording mortgage document transactions in March 1994, to deal with the sale of mortgage portfolios by financiers, which allows these transactions to be processed more quickly.

A revised land title registration practice manual is expected to be published in September this year and it is anticipated that it will reinforce the need for compliance with DOLA practice and procedure by clients, leading to a reduced error rate by lodging parties. It will also help to avoid the current average of about 100 requests for advice each day from the industry.

By June 1994 DOLA will achieve a reduction of 150 staff. On Thursday, 12 May the Leader of the Opposition in another place made reference to this reduction and also to "a further 150 to go". I am unsure of his source of information, because it is inaccurate. However, he may have been referring to the former Labor government cuts in DOLA staff which amounted to 162 during its term of government. These were generally across the board cuts with reduced level of service and included the period of the last property boom. However, this Government is committed to reforming the public sector to provide greater opportunities through competitive tendering and contracting of service to the private sector. DOLA's reduction of 150 staff is primarily a direct result of the contracting of non-core activities. They cover a range of operations in DOLA and are expected to open up a more competitive and cost effective environment for the delivery of services.

None of the staff reductions resulting from these contracted out services has a direct impact on processing land transactions. On the contrary, the contracting of services is expected to result in more cost effective use of staff and financial resources. It should be understood that the public sector reform program and the current business levels in DOLA are separate issues. As I have informed the House, the number of land transactions has increased. However, it is important for members to realise that there has been no major disruption in land transaction processing for the majority of land transfers of established homes. In most cases the recording of sales is a process which will take place in due course at DOLA. Hold-ups in this process do not affect the sale and settlement of established homes or the subsequent occupation of newly acquired residences. DOLA always holds approximately 10 000 to 12 000 land transaction documents in various stages of processing at any one time. The real backlog on 20 May, therefore, was approximately 14 000. I am pleased to advise that the average processing time has now been reduced to 10 working days through use of overtime, contract staff and reassignment of staff resources in DOLA.

Finally, I fully support and compliment DOLA staff for the way in which they have willingly volunteered to work overtime in order to cope with the large increase in land transactions in servicing community needs and expectations. It is unfortunate that their dedication and commitment have been the focus of adverse media comment primarily generated by some who have yet to accept DOLA's relocation to Midland.

[Consideration of the statement made an Order of the Day for the next sitting.]

ADDRESS-IN-REPLY

Motion

Resumed from 12 May.

HON T.G. BUTLER (East Metropolitan) [8.15 pm]: Before I start, I congratulate

Hon Iain MacLean on his election to this place. I hope he finds his time here not only interesting but also rewarding.

Hon Tom Helm: He is on the wrong side of the House.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: He will be over here in three years' time!

The DEPUTY PRESIDENT (Hon Barry House): Order!

Hon T.G. BUTLER: I do not need members' help.

When time expired on the last day of sitting I had completed my remarks on the industrial relations scene and was about to move on to services to the at-risk youth of our society. Since then I have had the opportunity to examine some documents which slightly changed my direction.

The first document I read was Report No 2 of the Auditor General of May 1994 regarding grants to non-government organisations. As the chairperson of a youth service, I am, as is my committee, constantly concerned about grants to youth services. The title of this report is "Performance Examinations". However, rather than concerning itself with the performance, examination or indicators of the various services in receipt of subsidies or grants, the report deals mainly with the performance examination or indicators of government funded agencies which are responsible for grants to the non-government organisations and the level of accountability by the government funding agencies. Their concern would be justified, not because of any illegal practices by the funding agencies, but because the waters are somewhat muddied by the fact that some of the non-government organisations received grants from more than one government funding agency.

Youth services such as the Lockridge Youth Service - the one of which I am chairperson - finds that, for the small amount it is granted to run the service, it is as accountable as a government funded agency. Anyone who has seen the manual containing the guidelines for a treasurer of a community based organisation will know it is about two inches thick. It is one of the most complex documents one could ever have the misfortune to read. Consequently it will be very difficult for community organisations to get people to volunteer for the role of treasurer. If government funding is, for example, only \$44 000 such as the Lockridge Youth Service receives, that high level of accounting should not be necessary. It becomes bogged down. It cannot operate properly and it becomes a real problem for the service because the treasurer takes on the position of the most important person in the organisation and there is nobody who can follow the direction of the accountability requirements from the Auditor General. Page 9 of the report under "Accountability for Grants in Agencies Surveyed" states -

The 15 government agencies surveyed indicated that they provided funds totalling \$289 million to over 3800 NGOs during the 1991-92 financial year. As some NGOs receive grants from more than one government agency this number involves a degree of double counting. The major source of the funds was the Consolidated Revenue Fund (now Consolidated Fund) which provided approximately \$197 million, with other significant sources being the Lotteries Commission (\$45 million) and the Commonwealth government (\$43 million). Total grants to NGOs by each of the 15 agencies ranged from \$1.6 million to \$105 million.

The government agencies referred to are: The Health Department, \$105m in grants to 350 NGOs; the Education Department, \$66m in grants to 400 NGOs; the Lotteries Commission, \$32m in grants to 1348 NGOs; the Department for Community Development, \$31m in grants to 604 NGOs; and others, \$55m in grants to 1187 NGOs. This led me to the conclusion that a single government funding agency should be established. I am pleased that the first recommendation in the report on this matter is -

A designated government agency should be given responsibility for facilitating and coordinating the adoption of appropriate grants management, principles and practices by government agencies.

The report is on the right track. The youth service, for example, receives \$44 000 to supply a service to at risk youth in the Lockridge-Eden Hill-Beechboro area. These are the youth most likely to offend. The wages bill for two people is in excess of the government grants by about \$10 000. That is simply because the Department for Community Development does not want to be seen as the employer of youth service employees; rather, it is subsidising the youth services and requiring them to rely upon the community for that assistance. In places such as Lockridge, Eden Hill and Beechboro there is no business community as such upon which one can rely for donations or support. Lockridge, which is a low socioeconomic area, could not be relied upon to support the service, simply because the people cannot afford it. The service is being run by two workers who are charged with the responsibility of running the service on a shoestring. They constantly write to a range of government funding agencies, chasing project and program money to keep youths occupied, free from boredom and out of trouble - and away from crime.

It has never made sense to me that we have so many bodies offering grants to organisations, such as NGOs. I recommend to the Government that it establish one funding body, leaving more time for the service workers to create activities and projects for the services.

Hon Cheryl Davenport: It might also help in stopping the problem that governments see in relation to the duplication of services if we had one funding, coordinated body.

Hon T.G. BUTLER: Hon Cheryl Davenport makes a good point and she is correct.

The second recommendation states -

All government agencies which fund NGOs should take immediate and concerted action to ensure that they have appropriate grants management, principles and practices in place for all grants.

I am not sure about that recommendation because I fancy that the responsibility to administer that would fall not with the government agency but with the NGOs. I am particularly concerned about the fact that the Government does not want to be seen as the employer of youth service workers. I am disturbed by its willingness at the same time to become the employer of officers in corrective institutions, which is the other side of the scale. The Lockridge Youth Service has about 500 contacts a week with approximately 100 people. It has a core group of between 35 and 40 people, divided on the basis of 52 per cent male and 48 per cent female, which is unusual for youth services, where the clientele is in the main overwhelmingly male. This funding situation is back to front. To service the core group of 40 young people the youth service receives from the DCD \$44 000 a year. I acknowledge that it also receives generous support from the Shire of Swan. The \$44 000 represents little better than \$1 000 for each client in the core area. My information indicates that it costs more than \$1 000 a week to keep a youth in a corrective institution. If each member of our core group were to be in an institution for three months, it would cost the taxpayer \$480 000. That does not make sense. Many of the clients who attend the youth service have court appearance records. By the time one boy was 12 years old he had appeared in court 72 times. The boy is now 14 and he is important to our youth service. I am pleased that, because of the programs which were put in place to assist them, none of the core group has appeared in the courts in the last two and a half years.

I refer members to the 1993 annual report which was compiled by the coordinator, Mr Roy Williams, for the management committee of the Lockridge Youth Service. It does not contain a lot of meaningless jargon because it was not written by bureaucrats; it was written by a very honest and down to earth young man. The report outlines the programs which were run during 1993, including the Lockridge women's interests group, of which there were six to 10 participants aged between 17 and 25; approximately six diet right programs each of which had between eight and 10 participants aged between 10 and 16; a young women's personal development program with 10 to 14 participants aged between 12 to 16; and Blue Light discos in which 25 to 35 people took part. It became very difficult to run Blue Light discos in Lockridge because of the reluctance of the

police to become involved. The Lockridge Youth Service now hires a bus to take the youth to one of the Blue Light discos in the northern suburbs.

The service also organised the Lockridge rage which was attended by between 250 and 300 people. It was a combined alcohol and drug free family evening which was held at the local oval and everyone had a great time. Incidentally, 94 to 98 per cent of the members of the core group of the youth service are Aboriginal youth. As a result, there was a large gathering of Aboriginal families at the Lockridge rage. Approximately 35 of the kids play basketball and 15 are involved in boxing. Between six and 10 youth aged between 17 and 25 have completed a community mural on the Rosher Road hall in Lockridge. It is a wonderful mural and Hon Derrick Tomlinson may have seen it. In addition, the service has been involved in a number of school holiday programs. It has referred people to the Department of Social Security for the Jobsearch allowance and pensions, to the Commonwealth Employment Service for employment and training, to Homeswest for rental assistance and purchase of homes, to the Department for Community Development for homeless allowance and substance abuse problems, to the Health Department, to the Aboriginal Legal Service and Legal Aid for court referrals and to the Department of Employment, Education and Training for Abstudy and Austudy assistance. The number of people referred to each of these services has been between two and 50. The Lockridge Youth Service has also been involved with a number of schools including the Culunga Aboriginal Primary School, the Lockridge Senior High School and the Lockridge Primary School and it has also had access to the Lockridge medical practice.

The Lockridge women's issues program was developed because there was a gap in women's services in the Lockridge area. It involved young mothers and mothers-to-be and it ran throughout 1993. It has been beneficial to the community by way of a community arts project and the acquisition of playground equipment for Woolgar Park, Lockridge. Up to 10 people were involved in this project and if they had not been involved they would have been sitting around doing nothing. The need for the project was identified by the Lockridge community. The diet right program was funded by Healthway and caters for eight to 10 young people each program. It is a life skills project in the areas of food and nutrition, budgeting and shopping. The outcome of this project is that each new course is always full and it is in its third year. Young people eat more healthily and have learnt budgeting skills. The diet right project has also catered for private functions of up to 80 people.

The young women's personal development program has resulted in a large downturn in teenage pregnancies, a greater awareness of sexually transmitted diseases and AIDS, greater awareness of contraception, greater bonding between young people, higher self-esteem, evidence of better self-worth and greater awareness of employment, training and education prospects. The success of this program is very obvious in the Lockridge area from the number of young mothers who are looking after their children in a way that was not witnessed previously.

It must be remembered that when these projects were started about two and a half years ago, none of the at risk youth in the Lockridge area had played sport in a mainstream competition. They had not taken part in any structured sport. However, they formed three basketball teams and the under 16 boys team were the 1993 premiers at the Eagle Indoor Sports Centre and two of the team members were awarded the most valuable player awards. The girls under 17 team was the grand finalist in the spring carnival in 1993. The basketball competition has greatly improved the self-esteem of the participants.

I know that many people do not regard boxing as a sport, but it is a way of life for these young people. If we do not harness their natural aggression they will bash each other in the streets. It is preferable that they take part in an organised boxing competition where they can wear boxing gloves and there is less chance of them hurting each other. In 1993 approximately 15 young people attended Auz Box, which is the second largest amateur boxing club in the metropolitan area. This has increased the self-esteem of the young people who have taken the opportunity to participate in this competition.

I come back to the young fellow whom I used as an example of what can be achieved with this kind of program. If members watched the Channel 9 news Monday fortnight ago they would have seen a segment about this young lad. By the time he was 12 years old he had appeared before the courts on more than 72 occasions. He was a proper little vandal who had absolutely no respect for anyone else's property. The coordinator, Roy Williams, had connections with the Auz Box gymnasium and recognised this young lad's ability and was able to harness his aggression to the point where he won best sub-junior for 1993 and was the Golden Gloves champion of champions for 1993 and the sub-junior state titleholder. Since becoming involved in boxing through the Lockridge Youth Service he has not appeared before the courts in the last two and a half years. Two other members of the core group were trained at Auz Box and they were selected to box at the Australian championships in Queensland in 1993 at which one of them won a silver medal. Most of the boys who attend boxing are offenders or most at risk of offending. Very few of them have offended in the last two years. I seek leave to have this document incorporated in *Hansard*.

[The material in appendix A was incorporated by leave of the House.]

[See pp 453-460.]

Hon T.G. BUTLER: A lot more could be read from this document, but now that it is in *Hansard* people will see the benefits of having in place programs which can steer young people away from the courts and into a better behaviour pattern. We have tried through the youth service to divert kids, where we can, from crime and from getting into mischief. The youth service runs its programs and projects in the hope that it can divert young people from going into institutions in later life. We have said constantly that more money should be spent on the front end of the problem, where youth are slowly slipping into crime, rather than on the other end, where youth have been in prison and come out to face a hopeless future. This philosophy is supported by Brian Burdekin, the federal Human Rights Commissioner. An article in *The Canberra Times* of 21 May states that -

Mr Burdekin, who headed inquiries into the plight of Australia's homeless children and the state of the nation's mental health system in recent years, said governments and the legal system had largely ignored the plight of such children.

He said there was overwhelming evidence that suggested children from violent homes, or physically abused, often ended up in prison or the mental health system and many suffered from alcohol or substance abuse or became involved in prostitution.

[Leave granted for the member's time to be extended.]

Hon T.G. BUTLER: I thank members. The article continues -

Mr Burdekin, who was in Adelaide to launch a training manual for working with women and children who have survived domestic violence, said governments were reluctant to attack the cause of the children's problems.

Instead, they concentrated on the "end of the equation" and spent money on more prisons and hospitals to catch young people once they had begun a downward spiral, rather than intervening to prevent them reaching that stage.

That is the philosophy that we follow. The article continues -

"What we see very often from governments, especially around election time, is a sort of knee-jerk law and order response of 'we'll fix these kids. They're bad. They're anti social'," Mr Burdekin said.

We agree that all governments, not just this Government, seem to take a blind approach to the problem. Not one of the youth service's core group members has appeared in court in the last two and a half years, simply because we keep them involved, keep them from getting bored, and run numerous projects. We could do a lot more if we had more money. We would have people out on the streets, reaching out for those young people and getting them into the service, and we would widen our projects, programs and opportunities so that those kids could stay out of the justice system.

I was surprised to read in the *Sunday Times* that the member for Geraldton was quoted as wanting to reintroduce the cane in order to reduce crime. He said, "We have to do something with these young people. They are really bad. What they really need is a good whipping." That is not verbatim reporting of his words, but that is exactly what he meant. I also read in *The Weekend Australian* that the rattan caning of the American youth, Michael Fay, in Singapore has not acted as a deterrent at all because four other vehicles have now been found with the same sort of vandalism on them as was done by that boy.

Hon W.N. Stretch: Do you reckon he did it again?

Hon T.G. BUTLER: No, I do not know that he would have done it again, and I doubt that he would have, but it did not stop four others from doing it. Were the member to take the time to read about the problem, he would find that over the last decade, 10 000 people, or an average of 1 000 a year, have been caned. Is that a deterrent? Last year, there were 3 000 canings. If that is a deterrent, then I am glad I am law abiding.

Hon P.R. Lightfoot: It seems like a deterrent to me, on my simple logic.

Hon T.G. BUTLER: We could say, "Let us hang a murderer so that he will not murder again." However, if we want to apply that logic, we should apply it all the way down the line. We could say, "If someone vandalises a car, we will cane him so that he will not do it again", but that will not act as a deterrent. We have to find ways to stop these young people from carrying out vandalism. It is no good caning them after the event if it will not stop others from doing the same thing. It may not even stop the person who is caned from doing it again.

Hon Tom Helm: People have been caned twice and they have been birched twice.

Hon W.N. Stretch: I have been caned more than twice.

Hon Tom Helm: Not with a rattan cane.

Hon T.G. BUTLER: We have to get away from this eye for an eye philosophy and look at what can be done to prevent young people from offending. I am surprised that Hon Bill Stretch finds it so amusing. He is sitting there with a grin on his face like a Cheshire cat.

Hon W.N. Stretch: No; it is my happy disposition. You are misreading it.

Hon T.G. BUTLER: We must look at diversionary methods of getting people out of trouble rather than making them pay the penalty after we have allowed them to get into trouble. I listened to the Address-in-Reply speech of Hon Bruce Donaldson. He said that a clip on the ear or a kick in the backside never did him any harm. It certainly never did me any harm, and I had my fair share of it. However, when I left school, I walked straight into a job, as did most of us in those days. We did not face the same pressures that youth face today. We did not see headlines such as the one that appeared in *The Canberra Times* on 27 May: "Youth lose 230 000 years by suicide". There are more pressures on our young people today than ever before.

We must take those things into consideration. I accept that people who commit violent crimes must be withdrawn from society as society must be safe from them. Nevertheless, we must be sensible about the whole matter and look carefully at what we can do for these people and stop the downward spiral referred to by Brian Burdekin. If someone goes to a corrective institution, and he is not rehabilitated, he certainly will have no support, except maybe family, when released from prison. Post release schemes should be available. Former cons are not the flavour of the month; people do not go out of their way to hire them, certainly not if they are black. If we gaol people, we must do something to make good citizens of them when released; rehabilitation processes should be put in place. We spend a great deal of money on prisons and corrective institutions. Currently the Australian Capital Territory is discussing building its own prison rather than sending its offenders to New South Wales prisons. It would make more sense to spend that money on preventive programs to stop people going to prison, rather than patching up the problem once they are there. If the money were spent on such programs, it would be saving money needed to keep people in gaol.

It is very frustrating, because program organisers spend a great deal of time writing to various government funding organisations for money for programs. We are lucky if we receive a positive response to one or two of the applications. In our program we have achieved a non-threatening, drug and alcohol free environment for youth aged between 10 and 25 years. We are proud that we have not had any young people on the program in court during the past couple of years. We hope that when we see the Government's law and order legislation - to which the Governor referred in his speech - it will include some diversionary programs and will provide serious funding to that area. In our program we deal with 35 to 40 people, because that is all the funding will allow. If we had 10 times the funding, we could help many more people. Money should be spent at the diversionary end of the equation. The \$44 000 a year spent on youth would prevent the necessity to spend \$480 000 over three months on imprisonment.

Once programs are established, they should continue. Hon Derrick Tomlinson opened the Bassendean Youth Service automotive project last year, which took children who did not fit into the mainstream of education and taught them mechanics, panel beating and spray painting. Initially six young fellows took part in the project, four of whom became mechanical apprentices and two of whom became panel beaters. This was a highly successful program. The following year 12 young people were nominated for the program.

The main source of funding was from the then department of employment, vocational education and training, which is now the Department of Training, but the funding for the program was cut off after one year. The claim was that it was not an accredited course with the Skills Standards Accreditation Board. Amazingly, it was not an accredited course when the funding was provided, and the accreditation certificates were being drawn up when the funding was cut off. Therefore, instead of a secure funding supply to get these people into the work force and away from the temptation of crime, the funding was cut off and the program is now very much in danger of folding. That is a great pity. The program had built a car which was to compete in Rally Australia this year. I understand that the matter is now with the Attorney General's department, and I hope some funds will be forthcoming to keep the program going. I support the motion.

HON M.J. CRIDDLE (Agricultural) [8.57 pm]: In supporting the Address-in-Reply, I congratulate Hon Murray Nixon on his speech. Also, I enjoyed the company of the Governor, Major General Philip Jeffery, following his speech to the Parliament. He seems to be a person of the people and I hope he enjoys his stay in Western Australia. I welcome Hon Iain MacLean to the Chamber, and I hope he enjoys our company and debates. In my contribution tonight I will touch on some export earning industries which are of great interest to my electorate. I shall also touch on my recent trip to Japan, which was led by the Speaker in the other place, with two other members of that House, Hon Doug Wenn and the Clerk. The wool and wheat industries came under notice on that trip. I shall also refer to the fishing and rock lobster industries.

The wheat industry in Western Australia produces six million tonnes of produce, which is 40 per cent of Australia's wheat exports. It is causing concern to the Agricultural Region that the protein levels in the crop have fallen. The Australian Wheat Board has introduced a new price scale which revolves around what is known as the 2 by 10 by 2000; that is, the aim of two tonnes of grain to the hectare at 10 per cent protein by 2000. However, if farmers do not make the 10 per cent protein level, the return will fall away significantly. A large area in the wheatbelt has had reduced protein yields due to constant cropping as a result of the cost price squeeze. The protein levels in some of those areas is approximately 7 per cent; the calculation is that \$10 is lost for every 1 per cent reduction in the protein level, which will lead to a \$30 reduction in return. If the protein yield increases by 1 per cent the farmer receives a \$5 bonus, and so on. That does not count the noodles pool, which goes from 9.5 per cent to 11.5 per cent, which gives a 15 per cent bonus. Bearing in mind that the protein is related mostly to rainfall - other factors are involved such as the date of sowing and the variety - if the crop flowers in the right window, there will be a better yield and the protein level will be more appropriate. Nitrogen is probably the most significant option, apart from rainfall. Nitrogen is fixed

mostly by the nodules in the clover and from the lupins in rotation. The farmers in some of the wheatbelt areas are not very proficient in growing lupins. Therefore, they are getting a double whammy of cost price squeeze plus the fact that they cannot put in nitrogen readily. The cost increases in fuel and rail also contribute to the difficulty. In some areas the rail cost of produce to the port is up to \$25 a tonne. The farmers are getting a first advance of about \$50 a tonne, which is just not viable. We need to look seriously at that 2 by 10 by 2000 structure in these early years so that the farmers can adjust the way in which they are farming. That would allow them to go back into the nitrogen and the wheat-lupin rotation. If these industries are put on a cost price squeeze, the work force will suffer as will the whole of the infrastructure in the wheatbelt. People will leave the area. The issue needs to be addressed immediately.

I will now touch on the trip to Japan. We were invited there as part of a sister state relationship to promote prosperity and goodwill. We flew direct to Tokyo and met with the Speaker of the Diet. It was a wonderful experience to visit the Diet. There are about 518 people in the lower House and 250 in the upper House. It is a very big structure and it is a wonderful thing to view. We met with the Minister for Home Affairs, Mr Ishi. He has a very interesting job. He is involved in electoral reform. The voting ratio between populations in the city to those in the country is up to 5:1. As the population of Tokyo is about 15 million there is an imbalance in the voting system. The Minister has in mind to restructure that imbalance. While we were in Tokyo we visited the fish market. To my amazement some of the fish are sold live. Our fishing industry has to take that into consideration and take advantage of it. We got an indication that live fish would fetch four times the price of others. We certainly need to develop that market. The Tokyo fish market covers a huge area of activity in the early morning. I would not like to hazard a guess as to how many people were there. Everything is sold, from the smallest shellfish to the 250 kilo tuna, a massive fish.

When we left Tokyo, we travelled on the Bullet train to Kobe and into the country for an Arbor Day ceremony. The size of the farms we saw on the way is totally different from anything we have in Western Australia. Some of the farms are about 1.5 acres of irrigated rice. The grain is held locally and the rice industry is supported. This year the rice industry has been under a lot of strain and we have been fortunate to export rice into the market in Japan, which has been a bonus. I am not sure whether that will happen every year. In conjunction with rice growing, the farmers in Japan have a system of alternating with a wheat crop each year. The country seems to be very fertile. They cultivate from the verge of the roads to the bottom of the mountains. Industry is involved in farming and there is not an inch of land to spare. There are toll gates on all of the roads. A lot of the roads are built with a view to getting back the funding by way of toll gates. Although the roads were very good, tolls had to be paid on all roads. At one stage we went through a seven kilometre tunnel. Obviously it is very expensive to build a road and the mountainous terrain would exacerbate road building problems. The countryside was totally different from ours. Everywhere there was evidence of where timber had been cut and re-seeded to cedar. The view is taken that the land should be re-seeded so that grandchildren will get the benefit of it. Although the cedar is cut, there is a continual re-seeding program. When we arrived at Teijima we joined in the Arbor Day ceremony, where the Emperor was in attendance. Our tour leader met the Emperor and the Empress who each planted a tree. In fact, each of us also planted a tree. If I have done nothing else, I have planted a tree in Japan - which I hope will grow.

On our return to Kobe we met with representatives from the chamber of commerce. We met a man who had previously been the president of Kobe Steel Ltd. He pointed out the huge extent to which his country relied on steel. Japan uses our iron ore to produce 60 per cent of its steel. That is a massive import. As I said, our mission was to promote prosperity and goodwill in Japan. The Japanese were more than pleased that we came. I am pretty sure that in the near future many of their folk will be joining us to look at our country. They are keen to come to Australia. One of the big problems is that the Japanese favour going to the Eastern States purely and simply because that is the destination of flights. The opening of the new airport at Osaka will see more flights from

4 September to the Eastern States. That is something that we should look at. I believe Ansett Australia will run 12 flights while Qantas Airways Limited will run four. Our products should link up with those flights in Darwin, so that we can join in an opportunity to send it to Japan. The Hata Government's Budget has not been passed yet, and perhaps that will occur by June. It is looking at trade reforms, which will give us the opportunity to join further in trade relations with the Japanese. There is a great opportunity for tourism, especially repeat tourism from the Eastern States. Perhaps the Japanese tourists could carry on from the Eastern States to Perth and then return to Japan from here. The big problem for the export of our produce to Japan and for tourism in Western Australia is air links. Our opportunity to get into the beef industry in Japan will be extended. There is talk of expanding the value of this export from \$1b to \$3b. In Western Australia a lot of money has been spent on feedlots. I am led to believe - Hon Murray Nixon may be able to enlighten me on this - there is a move to get Western Australian beef into Japan. The beef in Japan contains so much fat, and it is very costly. In our dollar terms, it sells for up to \$700 a kilo. It was a real eye opener to me. There was a lot of fat and a lot of fat marbling in it. I was amazed and took photographs to assure myself I was not being led astray. The dairy industry has the opportunity to export ice-cream to Japan. The Japanese like ice-cream. Hon Sam Piantadosi will be interested to know that the Japanese vegetable product has to be of prime quality. If producers do not have the quality they will not have the opportunity to market their products. We should certainly send our products from Carnarvon, maybe down south and obviously Geraldton, if we got that link up into Darwin so that we could join the Eastern States and get our products sent by air. Australian wine to the value of \$17m is taken by Japan, where wine is very expensive. We certainly have good wines in the south west that they could enjoy, as they enjoy other products. The product of a local noodle firm here is being received on the shelves over there at not a very high price, so there is a real opportunity to develop that outlet. Western Australian hay is another product that has been taken on board, and there is an unlimited opportunity for good quality hay.

As to the wool industry, I went to the IWS when I was there and spoke to other members in the trade. Just about every man there wears a suit and tie. The message from the IWS was that there is a great opportunity for 20-21 micron wool in the cool wool type garments. If we got the odd fellow over there to wear these suits they would certainly use a lot of wool. We had the impression that they may move offshore for their scourers. They scour the wool in China and then spin it in Japan. I was surprised to learn that is the way the industry is moving. The Garnaut report caused some concern over there, not because they are getting rid of the stockpile problem immediately, but because of the long term aspects of it. They are worried about what will happen when the stockpile starts to run down. With the fall off in production, which is something around 750 million kilograms now, it will put pressure on the stockpile. They are concerned that the price will go through the roof once more. As producers we should look at the position in two or three years' time when perhaps pressure is on the supply.

I touched on the subject of fish earlier. I saw cultured fish in the marketplace as well as abalone out of the Eastern States. Here is a real opportunity for people in Western Australia. There is a venture at Jurien Bay where there is a great opportunity for people to invest in a hatchery and a grow out facility. We do not want to lose this to overseas operators. It would be nice to have our own facilities in Jurien, because we have pristine waters to grow the fish so they will not be polluted in any way. The crayfishing industry has caused some problem. The production figures we have to the end of April indicate that locally we are doing fairly well. The catch at the end of April totalled 9 145 tonnes, which is 13.1 per cent down on last year's figures. It is worth something like \$40m more than the crayfishermen earned in the same period last year. In the Fremantle zone it is something like 3 882 tonnes, in Jurien 1 363 tonnes and in Geraldton almost 4 500 tonnes, making a total of 9 145 tonnes. I mentioned that equates readily to last year, which was a record year of 10 552 tonnes. Obviously there is a great advantage in the price. I saw and ate lobster which was cooked in front of us, and the Japanese maintained that it was from Western Australia. The price of lobster over there is very high. The figure at the end of April was \$27 but is now approaching \$32. Obviously the

average for the season is going to be very high. The big bank at Shark Bay has produced 359 tonnes of lobsters valued at \$9m caught by 120 boats. In comparison there were 336 tonnes caught last year by 82 boats. The catches have been up and there were substantially more boats there. Catches in the Abrolhos were slightly above average during the opening two week period. Due to the 18 per cent pot reduction, catch levels have remained relatively high. In comparison to levels for the previous season they are two and a half per cent up. The overall catch from the Abrolhos Islands is said to be similar to that of last year.

The Puerulus settlement is a real worry for this year. We need to have some package in place. I met with the presidents, Calero, Tucker, Young, Hill and Wass and the Minister in Geraldton just recently. While there is still some disagreement about what is going on they were prepared to sit down and admit that something had to be done about a package. There is consensus that they need to look after their industry. That also was made clear in Japan. I have read that fisheries around the world are suffering. We need to be very careful about what we do in the near future.

Those are the issues I wanted to raise in my short address. With those few remarks I support the motion.

HON J.A. COWDELL (South West) [9.19 pm]: In following on from Hon Murray Criddle I would like to touch on my international fact finding committee trip this evening. Unfortunately I have not been anywhere, so I cannot. Nevertheless, this evening I would like to welcome our new member, Hon Iain MacLean. I will take the opportunity to touch on some matters of concern to my constituents in Mandurah and Murray. Firstly, it would be remiss of me not to thank the Minister for Transport for the most generous attention he has shown to the citizens of Mandurah - not for his epic float down the Dawesville Channel in the state barge, as we all witnessed, nor before that the highly publicised dinghy row with Roger and Arthur.

Hon J.A. Scott: Is that what accounts for the rise in fertiliser in the estuary?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Yes, there were concerns about the tide levels as well. I cannot thank him for the delivery of the rail system to Fremantle and Perth, knowing his attitude to trains, rail services and rail systems, unless they end up in Northam or some similar National Party constituency, in which case they are sound and worthwhile instruments of economic development. I sometimes think that the citizens of Mandurah and Murray would have done better to vote for a National Party member rather than Liberal members in their quest for a rail link to the metropolitan area. Be that as it may, it is not that the citizens of Mandurah need to thank the Minister for Transport for his interest in the bus service and improvement of same, because there has been none; nor for the freeway extension that has not progressed beyond the allocations made by the previous Labor government; but for the Minister's attention to the fare paying public transport passengers. Who can forget the Minister's more than ample attention in the past to those same fee paying passengers? I refer to the Minister's comments in this Chamber on 29 June last year when he reminded us -

Do members realise that 60 per cent of all passengers on the public transport system in Western Australia are concession passengers? A great many of the concession passengers pay only 20 per cent of the adult standard fare, not 50 per cent as everyone believes is the case. Most people believe that a concession is a half price fare. As a consequence of that ridiculous situation, during discussions with Transperth I agreed that something must be done to address the anomaly. Over time we must increase the concession fare to 50 per cent of the standard fare. That will be fair and reasonable because most people believe that is the concession fare currently.

In implementing that sound logic, the Minister has not forgotten the public transport passengers in the constituencies of Mandurah and Murray. As we saw today with the announcement of the new fare structures with some city fares increasing as little as 5 per cent, Mandurah constituents were "pleased" to see that their fares were to increase on average between 15 per cent and 24 per cent. However, they cannot be critical because last year's attention gave them a 71 per cent increase.

Hon J.A. Scott: That is decentralisation.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: I know. Today the Government announced that Mandurah students and pensioners would have a generous 23 per cent increase in bus fares.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: They should have voted National Party.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Indeed. They would have received subsidised fares and a rail system to ride on. The price of a multirider ticket for students and pensioners in Mandurah will rise from \$11.05 to \$13.70. A one-way trip to Perth will rise from \$1.30 to \$1.60 for concession card holders. Those least able to afford the price hikes will be forced to pay the most.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: At that rate, it would be a one-way trip because they would not be able to afford the trip back.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Indeed. It is part of the problem of centralisation. If that is not bad enough, ordinary commuters will be faced with a 15 per cent fare increase. The price of an adult multirider fare will increase from \$40.80 to \$47.15. A one-way fare to Perth will rise from \$4.80 to \$5.50. For both concession card holders and full fare paying adult passengers, the increases are well in excess of any increase that would be justifiable on the basis of our current inflation rate, which is around 2 per cent.

In a period of just over 12 months of Liberal Government, Mandurah students and seniors have seen their fares double. The cost of a trip to Perth has increased from 80¢ to \$1.60. Multirider fares have risen from \$6.45 to \$13.70 for concession holders.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: They have not fared well.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Indeed. Those who pay the full fare have seen their weekly multirider fares increase from \$30.75 to \$47.15.

Hon B.K. Donaldson: You are forgetting to mention the massive hike of fuel excise by the Federal Government which has added an imposition which is crippling this country.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Hon Bruce Donaldson could probably even work out that those increases are not indexed to the CPI. We will deal with the Federal Government later. With the attitude of the current Government on public transport, no doubt we will see a further erosion of services and more price increases. Of course, the privatisation of Transperth is yet to come. If I were waiting at a bus stop in Mandurah, I would not be holding my breath for the next bus to arrive, nor for that matter the train service from Perth to Fremantle. We cannot count on getting that this side of the millennium. Today the Minister for Transport made a generous contribution which my constituents would want me to acknowledge.

Then there are the generous attentions of the Minister for Health masquerading as the Minister for Fair Trading. Let us not say anything about the failure to improve hospital facilities at Mandurah, despite a heavy dose of rhetoric prior to the election or the Minister's tough talking trip to Pinjarra when he told the locals to expect less and be grateful. Who can forget the heady promises that were made at election time by the coalition, still chaste and untouched? It promised to upgrade health facilities to cope with a rapidly growing population, including many young families - Hon Bruce Donaldson would recognise this from the policy document. There was a promise that a coalition government would obtain additional staff to open all beds - an additional two beds were not open at that stage - expand the bed capacity to 64 beds, open the existing maternity facilities, upgrade accident and emergency facilities and establish a coronary care unit at the hospital.

Hon Doug Wenn: This is Pinjarra?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: No. They are going to close down Pinjarra; this is at Mandurah where the votes are. This must be based on the Bosnian model by the nature of the facility as I observe it at the moment. The promise was to provide a surgical team particularly for orthopaedic and cataract emergency and to increase funding for research and education regarding the Ross River virus. That is an impressive array of promises.

That was not the point I was making to the Minister for Health. It is within the capacity of the Minister for Fair Trading to fix Mandurah's trading hours, and I refer to his contribution in that regard. He will no doubt have another attempt at this, certainly as the softening up process appears to be under way. I refer members to the various headlines which have appeared in the local Mandurah paper under the heading "Mandurah urged to 'grasp opportunity'", which relates to 24 hour trading. The *Mandurah Telegraph* states "Professor warns over trading laws" -

Deregulation does not sound the death knell for small business.

It leads to a stronger retail sector, increased employment and a boom in tourism, according to a University of Queensland professor who recently completed a study into its impact.

In Mandurah last week, Professor Geoffrey Kiel said part-time employment in small retail business had doubled in the past 12 years.

The professor came to Mandurah and I received a copy of his report. The report had been generously commissioned by Coles Myer in the public interest and related material had been distributed. The softening up process relating to trading hours has begun once again with the failure of Mandurah to become the first domino to fall in what is essentially the outer metropolitan area.

I report to the Minister and the House that the people and the City of Mandurah have tried retail trading deregulation and have emphatically rejected the experiment. On 16 March this year, the City of Mandurah unanimously rescinded its previous theoretical support for totally deregulated trading. The message was then conveyed to the Minister to act on. This decision followed a turbulent period of one month's experiment with totally deregulated trading. If any doubt exists about the wishes of the people of Mandurah, I remind members that earlier this month I presented a petition to this House containing 1 640 signatures of citizens of Mandurah and surrounding districts objecting to the deregulation of retail trading hours throughout Western Australia and the possible reintroduction of 24 hour, seven day a week trading in Mandurah. If these two messages appear ambiguous, members need only look at the outcome of the City of Mandurah elections earlier this month to be guided further. There was battling Bill Hayworth who took a big dive coming in last in the coastal ward contest. Battling Bill was known for his public stand for deregulated trading and made this an issue in the council elections. Battling Bill regularly appeared on the front page of the local newspaper with petitions which had been placed in Coles stores. It was Battling Bill standing on the 24 hour platform who went down in a heap. Then there was Citizen Corp who took a tumble in town ward, attracting only a quarter of the votes of his opponent. That is Citizen Corp of the Residents Call for Trial and Proper Understanding of 24 hour Trading. If members are in doubt they need only look at the results of the City of Mandurah elections on 24 hour, seven day a week trading and the results of the pro-deregulation candidates standing on those prominent platforms. I will discuss other lessons to be learnt later in my comments.

Hon John Halden: Were they well founded campaigns?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Yes. The petitions have been presented to this House and the unanimous resolution of the City of Mandurah prior to the recent council elections indicated that the city had tried 24 hour trading and did not wish to persist with that experiment. The experiment was an unhappy saga for the whole community. It started with the Mandurah City Council passing resolution G6215 on 21 December 1993 and conveying that to the Minister. The resolution stated that council advise the Minister for Fair Trading that it supports the deregulation of retail trading hours within the City of Mandurah on a permanent basis.

Half the councillors declared an interest and refrained from voting because they were small traders, so they were outside the door. The other half appeared not to know what they were doing as events subsequently proved and given the statements made in the media. The council resolution followed a very superficial consultation with local bodies,

but not individual retailers, and this elicited mixed responses. The announcement of ministerial deregulation of trading hours for the City of Mandurah under section 5 of the Act effective from 25 February this year with the accompanying announcement that Coles stores would trade 24 hours a day, seven days a week came as a shock to the citizens of Mandurah. The papers announced "Mandurah gets 24 Hour Trading", "Mandurah traders can open 24 hours"; immediately followed by "Cowdell Fears Worst Over 24 Hour Trading". It was a perceptive comment. Soon thereafter the battle lines were drawn with "Small Retailers Will Fight"; then we progressed to "City Trade War Looming"; and then the small shopkeepers in the Forum shopping centre were forced to extend their trading hours to Sunday to compete with Coles, which also occupies that shopping centre. Then, of course, the small retailers rejected extended trading hours. We had a number of stormy community meetings and consultations.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: As part of the consultative process?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Yes, as indeed Mr Arthur Marshall was very much part of the consultative process. Mr Marshall said that the reason he had got out of his sporting goods store was the terrible introduction of Saturday afternoon trading. That prevented him from going to sporting events and he said how much more dreadful it would have been to trade even longer hours. That received warm approbation from the people at the meeting, who then turned their wrath on the mayor who said he only acted on the advice of the Chamber of Commerce. The Chamber of Commerce said it had misunderstood the situation and had been misinformed. Then everyone agreed that the Minister was at fault because the Minister was not there. It was resolved that the Minister should rectify his mistake.

Hon N.D. Griffiths: What was Mr Cowdell's view?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: It was in line with the mood of the community.

Hon N.F. Moore: You are nothing if not flexible.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: In the abstract people thought that they might like totally deregulated and 24 hour trading but those businesses, individuals and families that form the backbone of the local community were damned sure their interests did not lie in keeping going 24 hours a day or until 11 o'clock at night to try to compete with Coles or Woolworths. I give two examples of letters I received, which have not appeared in the Press nor been made public but which are relevant to the situation.

Hon Derrick Tomlinson: Now to be preserved for posterity in *Hansard*.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: Indeed, as are the comments of Hon Derrick Tomlinson. The first letter is from E.R. and L.J. Healey -

Dear Mr Cowdell,

Deregulated trading hours in Mandurah had a marked effect on our business.

Please find below the main points.

Effect on Income.

March gross takings dropped by \$9376. Most noticeable times that trading reduced was after 5.30pm at night and on Sundays. Weeknight trade dropped to almost nothing which makes opening later out of the question. Sunday trade dropped more on each weekend of deregulation from an average of \$7672 to \$5225, the last weekend being helped by Easter. The first four weekends dropped by \$1600, \$1900, \$2300 and \$2900 respectively from the previous average. Sunday trade in particular dropped by about 40%. Our deli is lucky to have good local patronage which I am sure is the only factor which prevented a more severe downturn of trade.

Effect on Staffing.

We employ three casuals. During the six weeks of dereg. their hours had to be reduced. The first couple of Sundays we sent a girl home early and after that she

was not called in at all. My family had to work more hours to compensate, as at that stage, we had no idea just how much the long term effect was going to have on the business. All three girls were concerned about losing their jobs or having reduced incomes.

Effect on Customers.

A large number of our customers are local and have relied on the shop over many years. Their main concern was that the shop may close down sometime if the trade was to drop significantly enough to be not viable. A petition against deregulated hours was supported by about 98% of customers. A large number of these were visitors to the town.

Effect on Family.

Myself, my wife, daughter and son in law operate the business which we only bought on July 31 last year. We work on a roster basis and because of the long hours required to work the shop, we employ some staff to enable everyone to have some time off. This became harder during the deregulation period as more attendance was needed at the shop.

There was also (and still is) a feeling of insecurity and despair with the drop in takings and the prospect of a reduced resale value on the business. Reducing prices to match the supermarkets makes the income worse, and extending our hours increases overheads. After 8pm at night trade drops to almost nothing, especially in winter and during cooler weather. Also, we are committed to rents and other outgoings which never change and in fact are more likely to increase than not.

The overall effect of deregulation was not good for our business. The fact that the Mandurah Forum is on one side of our shop and the city centre on the other would probably have had more effect on our business than if it were out of town. However, having been in contact with other store owners it is a fact that every business was affected in some way.

We feel that some regulation is still necessary in provincial and country centres. Small business helped to build these places up and should not be squashed by big national and multi national concerns chasing huge profits.

I hope this fairly brief letter helps you to understand our concern.

Indeed, I will refer briefly to one other letter -

My name is Laurie Williams. I operate a Supa Valu Supermarket in Mandurah in partnership with my wife, two sons and their wives. We employ a staff of 20 people in total, a mixture of seniors, juniors plus 4 butchers.

We, along with the other 13 tenants of this centre are greatly concerned about the viability of our businesses with possible long term deregulation of trading hours. If this were to happen, it would have a very serious effect on all small to medium size businesses in the Mandurah area as we could not match the trading hours of the major chain stores, Coles and Woolworths, whose profits leave this town and state. We are a family owned and operated business where profits stay in W.A.

We have had the very best of trading situations in Mandurah where we have been able to trade all school and public holidays plus all Sundays in December and January. The general public and tourists have been well pleased and satisfied with this arrangement. We would expand to our customers needs if it were viable and needed, but at this point in time it is not.

Sir, along with most small businesses in the state, we have supported the Liberal party with dollars and votes, we therefore are very dismayed and angry that after ten years in opposition that you have seen fit to cause anxiety and concern to the same people that have supported you.

We ask you take into account the huge effect on the profitability of small businesses when you make your decision on deregulation.

They were only two of the letters I received but they are indicative of the sentiment of a very significant section of the local community, a section of the community not the normal constituency of this side of the House. So, I convey the message to the Minister and to the Government from the Mandurah experiment that they should not proceed with total deregulation of trading hours. The Government and the Liberal Party have been playing Pontius Pilate on this issue - not Mr Charlton and the National Party - washing their hands in public while privately issuing the order for the crucifixion of small business. Nothing is plainer.

Hon Derrick Tomlinson interjected.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: There is always innovation. The Government's attitude is expressed by the Minister responsible, in word and deed. We have the example of copious use of section 5 of the Act to deregulate the whole of the country as a prelude no doubt to total deregulation in the metropolitan area.

Hon George Cash: That is the section used by Mrs Henderson when she was Minister.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: It was, but to nowhere near the same degree.

We have the example of the Minister completely ignoring his advisory committee and refusing to summon it in case it put an alternative view. Of course, the fact that there is a hand washing exercise by Pontius Foss cannot be doubted but, to take the Mandurah example, actions speak louder than words. The Government's hand can be seen on the ground, at least at the early stages in Mandurah, with respect to the letters written by the Mandurah Tourist Bureau - a notorious Liberal front organisation. Then of course the member for Mandurah, Mr Nicholls, initially warmly welcomed total deregulation in the City of Mandurah. That warm welcome very soon changed, and I cannot conceive of the fact that the Minister for Fair Trading did not consult his party colleagues, or at least his ministerial colleague, the member for Mandurah, prior to making the decision to totally deregulate trading hours in the City of Mandurah.

The hard line attitude that guides the Government has been expressed again and again by party ideologues. The Liberal Party President, Bill Hassell, has for some years strongly put the point of view. To quote Mr Hassell from an article in *The West Australian* a few years ago -

The small shopkeepers are very uptight about the issue. It's a neat combination of self-interest and selfishness. The small shopkeepers who don't trade extended hours don't want to because they feel it will ruin their lifestyle, just like the shop assistants. The small shopkeepers who, under existing exemptions do trade extended hours, don't want the competition of other traders. When it comes to trading hours, principle and belief don't come into the argument. The self same folk who scream about high taxes, big government, union restrictions and government red tape and who back Sir Joh Bjelke-Petersen, seem to lose all their entrepreneurial skill and belief in competition. They want regulation, and that's it.

Even the real dollar arguments about tourism and what it can bring in have been forgotten in the scramble to maintain the restrictive regulatory control of the simple act of shopping. Why Western Australia, bursting with entrepreneurial enterprise, should be tied down with such anti-diluvian restrictions on trading can be traced to two simple factors - power and politics. . . . the continuation of a rigid and inflexible regulatory trading hours system must end.

That is a quote from the eminence grise of the Liberal Party. The Government's backers, apart from the President of the Liberal Party, have never been silent on this matter. The Western Australian Chamber of Commerce and Industry has consistently expressed dismay and disappointment that previous governments have not totally deregulated retail trading hours, and the chamber has consistently supported the recommendations of the Kelly report in that regard. So, we have the clear example of the intent of the Government, or I should say part of the Government, to go along the track of total deregulation of retail trading hours, particularly having achieved this partially by the use

of section 5 of the existing Act in country areas. Mandurah was supposed to be part of this presumably so that when we came to the ministerial review, which is currently taking place, the Government could point to the fact that the country was already totally deregulated and it was only a matter of logic that the city should be next.

In this instance, Mandurah was not the first domino on the outskirts of the metropolitan area to fall. The case against total deregulation is straightforward. The comments of Winston Churchill, when introducing British regulations 80 years ago, are still relevant today. Churchill, in introducing that legislation, said -

We are merely seeking to make arrangements for distribution as shall secure for the distributors a reasonable opportunity of rest and leisure. That cannot be done by themselves as they have abundantly proved. Shop assistants cannot by their organisation affect this reform - they cannot do it by agreement. That has been tried and failed. Both sections ably supported by the public have attempted to effect these alterations of hours and both have succeeded so little that I think we are entitled to say that voluntary effort in this direction has conclusively failed. Neither the shopkeeper nor the shop assistant nor the customer have the power to draw the line and make the rules. They must come to parliament if this reform is to be achieved.

He then, in introducing the Shops Bill in 1911, said -

Shop assistants don't mind hard work. What they ask with increasing force is that there shall be a fair proposition of life. What they ask with increasing force is that after work there shall be a fair opportunity for rest, for leisure, for recreation, for the pleasures of family life . . . It is the lack of organisation that has led to the work of this great body of people being stupidly aimlessly spread out and sprawled over the whole of the week.

Churchill's comments when introducing the regulation of the British system 80 years ago are still relevant today. They are certainly saner than our Government's lusting after a return to the nineteenth century ideal of the dark satanic mills. I cannot go into the case for the continuation of the regulation of retail trading hours in any detail, but 10 relevant points are set out in the Kelly report. Mr Kelly did not come to the obvious conclusion in this case, but nevertheless the points are relevant. The report states that full time employment would give way to part time casual and junior employment, thus leading to the loss of long term career opportunities in the industry; that it would have a disruptive effect on family and social life and the use of leisure time; that it would lead to delinquency and to a deterioration in family relations; that labour costs and other operating costs would increase, thus leading to an increase in prices - unless of course, one has already effectively nobbled the labour market as the Government has done; that employers would initiate cost cutting measures such as understaffing or the employment of casuals and juniors to such an extent that service would suffer; that specialist shops and small shops in which a reduction of staff or employment of casuals was not a viable proposition would face increased costs without a corresponding increase in turnover and profits, thus forcing many to close; that shops located in shopping centres would be forced to open, because of the provisions of their lease agreements, whether it was profitable for them to do so or not; that larger businesses would profit at the expense of smaller ones, thus leading to a monopolistic situation; that there was a finite limit to consumer spending power irrespective of the number of hours for which shops were open; and that there was no need for public demand for additional shopping hours, but that such demand as there was came from major retailers who expected to profit from such a change.

I will admit there is a demand from time to time, but when it is put to the test not many people are willing to pay the price for a marginal increase in convenience. Finally, we must consider in the increasingly deregulated labour market that this blunt instrument of opening and closing hours may be the only instrument that is available to save workers and the relative conditions that they enjoy. The argument to the contrary put by Kelly contains many fallacies. Certainly if further deregulation were contemplated there would

have to be preliminary legislative reforms; that is, reforms in terms of the prevention of anticompetitive lease agreements, the use of fair practice and fair trading legislation to deter monopoly and oligopoly situations, and the need to prevent abuse of the market by the majors extending a system of vertical integration of the industry. That is where a particular supplier is induced not to sell to independents or they will be precluded from selling to the majors. The Government would need to make sure those conditions were in place in order to allow any further deregulation, and I see no initiative on the part of the Government to ensure that any of those reforms are in place.

I will proceed to the views as expressed by my constituents in Mandurah and Murray. I am glad to see that the Minister for Transport has returned. I have acknowledged the citizens' gratitude to the Minister and, of course, also to the Minister for Fair Trading for the experiment that he foisted upon the citizens and particularly the small traders and their families in Mandurah.

I turn briefly to the contribution of the Minister for Education. I do not know how many times the Liberal Government or its local representatives can decently re-announce the Commonwealth's allocation of \$240 000 to the Pinjarra High School, but I suppose there is an end to everything.

Hon N.F. Moore: You seem to have forgotten something about commonwealth-state relations.

Hon E.J. Charlton: Where does the Federal Government get its money from?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: The same place the Minister gets it from.

Hon N.F. Moore: The same place you get it from.

Hon E.J. Charlton: It does not own a farm or a mine.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: There is of course the technical and further education success story. When the Government was in opposition it put forward a policy that said a coalition government would immediately proceed with the purchase of land for a Peel regional college site, and argued that the previous government had not moved promptly. We are now over 12 months into the period of this Government. First the Commonwealth was to blame because there was no funding.

Hon N.F. Moore: Nobody has blamed the Commonwealth. That is not true. Who blamed the Commonwealth?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: That was even though the state at that stage had not even approached the Commonwealth.

Hon N.F. Moore: The money was allocated in the Budget; nobody made the comment. The member should get his facts absolutely right. I have never claimed that.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: The reports in the local Press seem to indicate otherwise.

Hon N.F. Moore: Sometimes reports in the local Press are not accurate. I have never made that comment.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: This was the view put locally. The Commonwealth granted the appropriate funds and it was initially to be a regional college in Figgerts Road, Ravenswood. Then there was a slanging match between the mayor and Minister and it was not Figgerts Road any more; it was perhaps Gordon Road or the Peninsula, with the eviction of pensioners from the local caravan park. We received letters of this nature from Mr Limbourne, who said -

I live at the above caravan park as a permanent resident.

This is the new erstwhile site of the TAFE college that is still coming.

Hon N.F. Moore: It is a recommendation of an independent assessment group, so be fair. You normally are. It is being assessed in that context.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: I said it was an erstwhile site; nevertheless, let me put the point of view -

Hon N.F. Moore: No, just make it accurate.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: - of the residents who may be in jeopardy if a decision is made to select this site.

I live at the above caravan park as a permanent resident. Approximately 70 other people have retired here and invested their savings in Park homes and Vans. Most moved here because the whole peninsula is mainly retirees and a \$3, million Senior Citizens Club has been built just outside the park. This Club, the town shops and all facilities are within walking distance of this park and is a perfect lifestyle for both the retirees plus the 100 or more part time residents.

The park is a major drawcard for tourists and is well recommended due to its location, appearance and facilities.

It seems someone is determined to destroy this park. I and many others would like to know who.

The Minister for Lands' office says it is not them.

Mandurah Council says that it is the Minister for lands despite their denial.

The Council say they would like a long lease at least 10 to 15 years. They say they could get a good income out of a 15 year lease.

It continues.

In an educational sense, the search continues for a TAFE site. I refer to the university venture which will be admirable in providing a part campus for Mandurah if it goes ahead. I trust that we will not see Rockingham and Mandurah receive a couple of buildings or a hall into which lectures are beamed and which becomes the replacement for a proper tertiary campus, which appeared to be going to Kwinana at an earlier stage.

Hon John Halden: With 200 students divided between the two campuses!

Hon N.F. Moore interjected.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: We will have to wait and see what is the alternative to the sacrifice Kwinana appears to have to make. Let us hope it is not for no gain with respect to either Mandurah or Rockingham.

Hon N.F. Moore: Are you suggesting we should not go to Mandurah or Rockingham, but should go to Kwinana?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: I did not say that.

Hon N.F. Moore: Would you like to suggest what you believe is right?

Hon J.A. COWDELL: I was making the point that we should not sacrifice a proper campus for two beam-in halls and a couple of buildings which are presented as an alternative to a campus.

Hon N.F. Moore: That proposition was recommended by Professor Stanley's group, who are experts in these matters.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: It may have been recommended by him; I am not disputing that.

Several members interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order! Let the member wind up his speech.

Hon John Halden interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order! The member is trying to conclude his speech.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: The citizens of Mandurah look forward to the third State Government high school that was promised by the Liberal Party in its election policy speech, although I am not aware that land for the suggested plan for Halls Head has been put aside. The citizens of Mandurah still look forward to the community based police officers who are to be situated in Mandurah and Coodanup Senior High Schools but whom they have not as yet seen.

I conclude with one point of "appreciation" to the Ministry on behalf of the constituents of Mandurah-Murray on an environmental note! The Government has laid the groundwork for an environmental wasteland in the Mandurah-Murray area. If members drive down to Mandurah, as I suppose most members have done, they will see the urban sprawl developing as San Remo expands to Madora, which expands to Singleton, Golden Bay, Secret Harbour and up to Warnbro. I fear that unless there is government action - I see no sign of that - we will find an uninhibited metropolitan sprawl all the way to Mandurah with no appropriate green buffer zones. The City of Mandurah has the lowest allocation of land for public reserves of any municipality in Western Australia. The Government has come out solidly in support of another canal development in Mandurah. Mandurah presently has five or six major canal developments. We do not need to gobble up the Creery Wetlands, despite the fact that the Government has put this forward as its policy. I am not in a position to read the letters of concern from constituents, but the way things are drifting south of the Dawesville Channel, the good citizens there will find themselves between two sewage treatment plants. Why the Water Authority wants two sewage treatment plants within about three kilometres of each other, with a built up area in between, I do not know.

Hon George Cash: I wish you would take up my offer of a briefing.

Hon J.A. COWDELL: I have indicated I am happy to take it up when I see any offer.

We recently debated the Cadardup reserve and no doubt the Yalgorup national park excision will come before the House shortly which will allow the local council to quarry limestone for the next 20-odd years. Why is the Government supporting the local council's operating a limestone quarry with the sort of blasting and heavy truck activity that takes place when there are cheaper, privately owned sources of limestone which would require no local government subsidy, and which may be forced out of business by this exercise, once again to the detriment of the citizens? These are instances in which the citizens of Mandurah look to the Government regarding their environmental future and nothing has been done. There is no Peel regional park; Mandurah has been prevented from accepting funds from the Commonwealth's coastal management scheme and of course no action has been taken to save the stromatolite area of world significance. The Government has specifically rejected that. The citizens of Mandurah and Murray look forward to better government policy in those areas.

Debate adjourned, on motion by Hon Muriel Patterson.

House adjourned at 10.19 pm

APPENDIX A

LOCKRIDGE YOUTH SERVICE INC

ANNUAL REPORT

JANUARY - DECEMBER 1993

Prepared by:

ROY WILLIAMS

Co-ordinator

APPENDIX A

PROGRAMS

<u>Program</u>	<u>No of Part.</u>	<u>Age</u>
Lockridge Women's Issues	6 to 10	17 - 25
Diet Right	8 to 10	10 - 16
Young Women's Personal Development Program	10 to 14	12 - 16
Blue Light Discos	25 to 35	10 - 16
Lockridge Rage	250 - 300	All ages
Basketball	35	14 to 18
Boxing	15	10 to 15
Community Mural (Roshier Rd Hall)	6 to 10	17 - 25
School Holiday Programs	35	10 - 16

REFERRALS

DSS - Job Search Allowance, Pensions	35	16 - 25
CES - Employment & Training	50+	15 - 25
Homeswest - Rental assistance Purchase of homes	15	18 - 25
DCD - Homeless Allowance, Substance Abuse	40	13 - 18
Health Department	5	16 - 18
ALS - Court referrals	10	14 - 17
Legal Aid - Court referrals	2	15 - 16
DEET - Abstudy, Austudy	25	16 - 18

APPENDIX A

.2.

Schools - Culunga, Lockridge
High, Lockridge Primary
ASPA Committee

45

10 - 16

Medical - Lockridge Practice

10

10 - 17

APPENDIX A

.3.

OUTCOMES OF PROGRAMS**Lockridge Women's Issues**

This project was developed as it was seen to be a gap in service in the Lockridge locality. It was formed from a project of Young Mother's and Mothers-to-be. This project was run throughout the whole of 1993 and has been beneficial to the community in a Community Arts Project and the acquisition of playground equipment in Woolgar Park, Lockridge. Up to ten people attended this project. These young women would have been sitting around doing nothing if they hadn't participated in the program. The need for the project was identified by the Lockridge community.

Diet Right

This program was funded by Healthways and caters for 8 to 10 young people per program. This is a Life Skills Project in the areas of food and nutrition, budgeting and shopping. The outcomes of this program is that each new course is always full and it is still running and is in its third year. Young people eat more healthily and have learnt budgeting skills. The Diet Right project has also catered for private functions up to 80 people.

Young Women's Personal Development Program

There have been a large range of outcomes from this project: Large turndown of teenage pregnancies; a greater awareness of STD and Aids; greater awareness of contraception; greater bonding between young people; higher self esteem; evidence of better self worth; greater awareness of employment, training and education prospects.

Blue Light Discos

Although Lockridge Blue Light Discos failed because of lack of support from local Police and parents, the Blue Light Discos in other areas have been very successful to the Lockridge Youth Service. Northern Suburbs Blue Light Discos has been a very important socialisation for the young people of Lockridge. Approximately 30 young people are transported to these Discos and home again. Young people have a better understanding of Police and Police work. This is a positive project as 30 people plus wish to attend each time.

APPENDIX A

.4.

Lockridge Rage

This was a one-off project which had a great outcome with young people, families and representatives from the whole community attending and being involved. The Lockridge community were able to socialise in a drug and alcohol free environment with a country band and D.J. on Woolgar Park without incident. It created better community development.

Basketball (Lockridge Raiders)

Young people are now playing sport in the mainstream. There has been considerable improvement in self esteem and self worth. The Under 16 boys team were the 1993 Premiers at Eagle Indoor Sports Centre, two players were awarded Most Valuable Player awards and the girls Under 17 were Grand Finalists in the Spring Carnival in 1993.

Boxing (Amateur)

Approximately 15 young people attended AUZ BOX in 1993. This is a self esteem project and the ability to enhance self worth. AUZ BOX became the second biggest Boxing Club in the metro area.

One young boxer (13 years) won Best Sub Junior 1993, Golden Gloves Champion of Champions 1993 and Sub Junior State Title Holder. This particular person prior to joining AUZ BOX, had appeared before the courts more than 72 times. Since becoming involved in boxing through the Lockridge Youth Service, he has not appeared before the courts.

Two boxers from AUZ BOX were selected to box at the Australian Championships in Queensland, one winning a Silver Medal. Most of the boys that attend boxing are offenders or most at risk of offending. Very few have offended in the last two years.

Community Mural (Roshier Rd Hall)

This was an art project that was completed by the Lockridge Women's Issues group. The outcome was a very worthwhile contribution to the community and has led to further artwork projects in the Lockridge community.

APPENDIX A

.5.

School Holiday Program

A variety of outings as well as centre-based activities are carried out each school holidays. These projects focus on self esteem, education and training, with a hope for employment in the future. All projects have a life skills emphasis. The outcomes of these programs are that they take young people off the streets and provides them with positive recreation and activities. School holiday time is well known to be a time of boredom if young people have nothing to occupy their time.

OUTCOMES OF REFERRALSDepartment of Social Security

Many of these young people were linked up to Job Search Allowances and/or Pensions. The majority of these people were school leavers for 1992. Approximately 35 young people - all positive referrals.

C. E. S.

Many of these young people were linked up to Job Search - approximately 35 young people. Some linked to JETS project and some on to training programs with CES. Total referrals approximately 50 to 55 per year, all positive referrals.

Homeswest

Referrals were made to Homeswest for housing, many were housed in the Lockridge community in flats, or duplexes for young families. Two people were referred to Homeswest for purchase assistance and have become home owners in 1993.

Department for Community Development

Referrals to DCD were made on behalf of homeless youth and those suffering substance abuse. A lot of good outcomes with regard to homeless youth. No follow up in regard to substance abuse. This issue needs to be addressed by DCD. Of the 40 young people referred to DCD in 1993, approximately 10 were for substance abuse.

APPENDIX A

.6.

The Lockridge Youth Service has recognised for sometime, the problem of substance abuse in the Lockridge area. This has been supported in Dr Pat Baines' Report. We have tried on a number of occasions to obtain funding through various Government Departments and Agencies to run a Substance Abuse Program entitled "Break the Cycle" but to date have not been successful.

Heath Department

All five people who were referred were assisted in regard to head lice and/or scabies. Treatment was granted and health issues addressed.

Aboriginal Legal Service

10 young people attended ALS for legal representation, all were represented.

Legal Aid

2 young people attended Legal Aid for legal representation. Both were represented.

School

Over 30 young people were referred to schools at the beginning of the year (Culunga Aboriginal School) and 15 young people have been referred back to school as they have dropped out or were new to the area.

The Lockridge Youth Service in conjunction with the Education Department have been successful in establishing the ALI (Alternative Learning Initiative) Program. This program deals with chronic truants on a one to one basis working towards getting them back into mainstream schooling.

Medical

The Lockridge Medical Practice has provided medicals to boys of AUZ BOX and much support to the young people with concerns about STD or AIDS and medical issues that need professional advice. 10 young people were referred, all outcomes were positive.

APPENDIX A**.7.****CONCLUSION**

The Lockridge Youth Service continues to operate and provides a non threatening, drug and alcohol free environment for young people of Lockridge and surrounding areas.

Our core group are mainly young Aboriginal people who are at risk.

As this report shows, many of these young people have been successfully integrated into mainstream activities such as school, employment, training programs, and sporting activities.

Many repeat offenders that are attending the Centre have had no further appearances in court since becoming involved in our programs.

We have a much lower incidence of teenage suicide and teenage pregnancies as a result of counselling and referrals and the majority of the Centre users have a much higher self-esteem than before joining our program.

Whenever possible the youth workers liaise with families of these young people and have been successful in getting some of the parents involved on a voluntary basis.

The one problem that is not being dealt with properly is substance abuse. Dr Pat Baines identified Lockridge as a very high risk area for substance abuse. The Co-ordinator of the LYS has developed a program to address this problem called "Break the Cycle". However despite repeated applications for funding from various Departments we have been unable to run this program because of lack of funds.

The numbers of young people attending the Centre continue to grow each month. Because of this and the continual problem of trying to get adequate funding to operate suitable programs, and also the uncertainty of the building we occupy, as a result we feel we are not adequately meeting the needs of the young people in the Lockridge Community.

QUESTIONS ON NOTICE

SCHOOLS - CLOSURES

No Closures 1995, 12 Month Consultation Period

2. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Education:

As the Minister has now twice broken his promises about the length of time school communities will have to consider possible school closures - first it was 12 months, then it was nine months and now it looks like being only six months - will the Minister give a commitment not to close any school in 1995 and restore his original promise to provide a full 12 month consultation period?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

Under the rationalisation process no government school will close unless the majority of parents of students at that school agree. As a consequence the question of the length of time for consultation will rest with each school community.

GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING - \$3m EXPENDITURE, WASTED

New Primary School Funding; Estimates Committee Referral

4. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Education:

- (1) Is the Minister aware that the \$3m so far wasted by the Court Government on unnecessary advertising and self-promotion would be sufficient to build a new primary school?
- (2) Will the Minister support the Opposition's attempts to refer this wasteful expenditure of taxpayers' money to the Estimates Committee for its detailed consideration and evaluation?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

- (1) I am not aware that \$3m has been wasted.
- (2) Not applicable.

GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING - \$3m EXPENDITURE, WASTED

Liver Transplant Units Funding; Estimates Committee Referral

5. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Health:

- (1) Is the Minister aware that the \$3m so far wasted by the Court Government on unnecessary advertising and self-promotion would be sufficient to purchase three liver transplant units for the State?
- (2) Will the Minister support the Opposition's attempts to refer this wasteful expenditure of taxpayers' money to the Estimates Committee for its detailed consideration and evaluation?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) I am not aware of any waste on advertising by the current Government, although I am aware of massive waste by the former government not only on advertising, but on the disgraceful misbehaviour of WA Inc. What could have been paid for by that money which was wasted is almost beyond comprehension. Western Australians will pay for that waste for generations.
- (2) Not applicable.

WARDS OF THE STATE - HELD IN CUSTODY

Judicial Inquiry into Physical and Sexual Abuse

7. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Health representing the Attorney General:

- (1) Is the Attorney General aware that a letter purporting to be signed by her

and sent to Senator McKiernan appeared in Senate *Hansard* on Thursday, 18 November 1993 on page 3128?

- (2) Is the Attorney General aware that in that letter purporting to be from her there occurs in the fifth paragraph the words "... it is not appropriate for a judicial enquiry to be considered at this stage."?
- (3) Will the Attorney General advise the House when it will be appropriate for a judicial inquiry to be held into physical and sexual abuses of wards of the State held in custody?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1)-(3) I refer the member to my response to question on notice 129.

SCHOOLS - WANANAMI-MT BARNETT COMMUNITY
Enrolments; Toilets; Staff Vehicles; Fire Extinguishers

9. Hon TOM STEPHENS to the Minister for Education:

- (1) How many students are enrolled at Wananami-Mt Barnett community School?
- (2) How many toilet blocks and toilets are available for student use?
- (3) How many toilet blocks are available for staff use?
- (4) What vehicle or vehicles are allocated for use by school staff?
- (5) Given the difficult driving conditions in the area, are these vehicles fitted with two way radios in case of emergencies and if not, why not?
- (6) Does the school have a fire extinguisher?
- (7) How many rooms does the school have for use as a staff room, principal's office, sick room, and time out room?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

- (1) As at the February 1994 census, enrolments were as follows: Eight preprimary, 30 primary and 17 secondary students.
- (2) One toilet block - two units each male and female.
- (3) Nil.
- (4) 4 x 4 Toyota Landcruiser diesel, 11 seat, personnel carrier.
- (5) Two way radios are provided at the discretion of the local district education office.
- (6) No. Fire brigade regulations require that only primary schools with canteens have an extinguisher fitted in the canteen.
- (7) The Education Department has provided the school with two 25 square metre rooms for uses other than general teaching, one of which is used as a principal's office/s.

ABORIGINAL AFFAIRS - TOWN BASED ABORIGINAL RESERVES AND REMOTE COMMUNITIES, FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY; OUTSTATIONS

11. Hon TOM STEPHENS to the Minister for Education representing the Minister for Aboriginal Affairs:

- (1) What are the names and locations of the 361 Aboriginal outstations in WA that have been identified by the Report on the Task Force on Aboriginal Social Justice (April 1994)?
- (2) Which of the outstations are in the Kimberley?
- (3) Where are the remaining outstations?
- (4) Which town based Aboriginal reserves does the State Government accept financial responsibility for?

- (5) Which are the 48 big remote Aboriginal communities for which the State Government accepts financial responsibility?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The Minister for Aboriginal Affairs has provided the following reply -

- (1) The task force report estimated there were about 361 outstations of which some 280 were in the Kimberley region. A list of these communities together with their locations is tabled for the member. [See paper No 77.]
- (2)-(3) See (1) above.
- (4)-(5) The Government does not accept financial responsibility for town based reserves or the 48 big remote Aboriginal communities. Rather, it commits funds to assist these communities with their ongoing operations. In respect of the 48 major communities, this financial assistance relates to funding for the maintenance of essential services. A list of these 48 communities is tabled. [See paper No 77.]

**COMMERCE AND TRADE, DEPARTMENT OF - ABORIGINAL ECONOMIC
BRANCH, ESTABLISHMENT**

14. Hon TOM STEPHENS to the Minister for Education representing the Minister for Commerce and Trade:

- (1) Is the Minister to establish an Aboriginal economic branch within the Department of Commerce and Trade?
- (2) If not, why not?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The Minister for Commerce and Trade has provided the following reply -

- (1)-(2) No decision has been made about this proposal which was recommended by the Task Force on Aboriginal Social Justice. The Aboriginal Economic Development Office currently performs the tasks identified by the social justice task force. The AEDO is responsible to me as Minister for Commerce and Trade. It is an incorporated entity which is supported by government funds channelled through the Department of Commerce and Trade. The Premier has invited comment on the task force recommendations by 30 July 1994 after which a decision will be made.

**JUSTICE, MINISTRY OF - JUVENILE JUSTICE PILOT TEAM PROGRAMS,
FREMANTLE AND ARMADALE, EVALUATION**

16. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Health representing the Attorney General:

- (1) Has there to date been an evaluation of the two juvenile justice pilot team programs operating in Fremantle and Armadale?
- (2) If so, what were the evaluation outcomes?
- (3) Is it the Minister's intention to fund more programs?
- (4) If so, where?
- (5) What is the annual funding allocated to the two existing pilot programs?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1)-(4) I am advised that a full evaluation of the two juvenile justice pilot teams is close to completion. Decisions with respect to more programs will be made part of the consideration of the evaluation report.
- (5) \$180 000.

**RESERVE 22266, LOT 166, IRWIN SHIRE - SEA SEARCH AND RESCUE
ASSOCIATION, LEASE GRANT**

18. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Lands:

With reference to the application by the Volunteer Sea Search and Rescue Association of Western Australia (Inc) for an extended lease on its present site, Reserve 22266, Lot 166, Shire of Irwin, will the Minister advise -

- (a) whether it is the Minister who must give approval for the land to be leased to the Sea Search and Rescue Association, as stated by the Shire of Irwin; or
- (b) whether the Shire of Irwin has control of the land and the Minister is unable to intervene in the matter, as stated in the Minister's letter of 16 February 1994 to the association;
- (c) if the answer to (a) is yes, will the Minister now proceed to grant the lease and allow the association to continue its planned upgrading;
- (d) if the answer to (a) is no, will the Minister advise the Shire of Irwin that it is free to grant the lease if it wishes to; and
- (e) if the answer to (b) is yes, and the Minister's advice of 16 February was correct, will the Minister make this position clear to the Shire of Irwin so that the confusion which has surrounded this matter can be cleared up?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

- (a) Yes. Reserve 22266 is vested in the Shire of Irwin with power to lease. However, any lease is subject to the approval in writing by the Minister for Lands.
- (b) The shire has care, control and management for the purpose of "recreation" subject to (a).
- (c) No. The shire has granted the Sea Search and Rescue Group occupancy on an interim basis to enable an alternative acceptable site to be identified for the group.
- (d) See (c).
- (e) In my view the Shire of Irwin is acting appropriately within its responsibility of having care, control and management of the reserve.

SELKIRK NOMINEES - RED ROOSTER APPEAL

Lot 103 Progress Road-Forrest Road, Bibra Lake

20. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

- (1) Is the Minister aware of the success of the appeal by Selkirk Nominees regarding Lot 103 on the corner of Progress Road and Forrest Road in Bibra Lake?
- (2) Is the Minister aware of the disparity that exists in the conditions imposed on Perth Waldorf School to maintain a natural vegetation buffer of 30 metres and Selkirk Nominees, which is required to maintain only a five metre buffer?
- (3) Can the Minister explain why Selkirk Nominees has been allowed to develop this site, for the purposes of a Red Rooster store, when it overturns previous commitments given to the Perth Waldorf School?
- (4) Is the Minister aware that there was an alternate proposal for this site by the Perth Waldorf School for a performing arts centre which would be used by the community?

- (5) Is the Minister aware that Selkirk Nominees is mostly constituted of executives and directors of Peet and Co?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) Yes.
- (2) The buffer requirements on proposals in the area were determined by the State Planning Commission following consultation with the City of Cockburn, on a case by case basis having regard to the individual merits and nature of the development involved.
- (3) The approval to develop the site is in accordance with the City of Cockburn's town planning scheme No 2. The Minister for Planning is not clear as to what commitments, if any, the member is referring to.
- (4) An alternative proposal was submitted to the council by the Perth Waldorf School after the amendment had been passed and the subdivision approved.
- (5) No, the Minister for Planning is not personally aware of the composition of Selkirk Nominees. Representations from individual members of Peet and Co expressing support for this amendment have, however, been received by the Minister for Planning.

SCHOOLS - HUNTINGDALE PRIMARY
Insufficient Classroom Space and Toilets

21. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Education:

- (1) Is the Minister aware that students at Huntingdale Primary School now have their art lessons outside due to lack of classroom space?
- (2) Is the Minister aware that there are only eight toilets at Huntingdale Primary School to service some six hundred students?
- (3) Does the Government plan to redress these situations?
- (4) If yes, when does the Government plan to do so?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

- (1) No. This decision has been made by the school. Lessons could be taken in the classrooms, a practice followed by most schools in the state, or in the practical or withdrawal areas.
- (2) Under Public Building Regulations 31(1) and 31(2) which govern the provisions of toilet accommodation, Huntingdale has 32 toilet fixtures provided to cater for up to 839 students. As the school has approximately 600 students, it is considered that it has adequate toilet facilities. Toilet fixtures for staff and preprimary students are additional to the 32 provided for the primary school students.
- (3)-(4) Over the past seven years, the Education Department has provided art-craft rooms and music rooms to new schools. Also, when older schools have received a major upgrade, provision of these facilities has been included, dependent upon availability of funds. While Huntingdale Primary School will be considered for inclusion in this program, no firm date can be given at this time.

CRIMINAL INJURIES COMPENSATION ACT - AWARDS MADE, 1993
Police Officers' Claims

25. Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN to the Minister for Health representing the Attorney General:

- (1) How many awards were made in 1993 under the Criminal Injuries Compensation Act and what was the total value of these awards?

- (2) How many, if any, of such claims were made by police officers and what was the total value of the claims?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) In 1993, 658 awards totalling \$4 825 738 were made under the Criminal Injuries Compensation Act 1985. Thirty-four awards totalling \$274 835 were made under the Criminal Injuries Compensation Act 1982.
- (2) In 1993, 58 claims were made by police officers. The total value of these claims is not readily available.

DCD NEWS - PRINTING DETAILS

26. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Community Development:

- (1) Who printed the DCD News, Department for Community Development, Western Australia, April 1994, Vol 1, No 4?
- (2) What was the cost?
- (3) If State Print was not used, why was it not used?
- (4) If it was not used, was it asked to tender?
- (5) If it was asked to tender, what price did it tender?
- (6) What price was tendered by the printer?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

Answer provided by the Minister for Community Development -

- (1) Lamb Print.
- (2) \$1 747.
- (3) Peachy Productions was contracted to undertake the production of the first four editions of the magazine. It selected Lamb Print to undertake printing on the basis of cost and time considerations.
- (4) No.
- (5)-(6) Not applicable.

WORKPLACE AGREEMENTS - BROCHURES, PRINTING DETAILS

28. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Labour Relations:

- (1) Who printed the workplace agreements brochures produced by the Department of Productivity and Labour Relations?
- (2) What was the cost?
- (3) If State Print was not used, why was it not used?
- (4) If it was not used, was it asked to tender?
- (5) If it was asked to tender, what price did it tender?
- (6) What price was tendered by the printer?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) Design Design printed the series of 11 brochures on workplace agreements.
- (2) \$5 876 for 55 000 brochures.
- (3) There is no requirement for a government department to use the services of State Print.
- (4) No.

- (5) Not applicable.
- (6) \$4 010 for 55 000 brochures.

MIDLAND WORKSHOPS - STUDY, COST

29. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

- (1) What is the cost to date of the Midland Railway Workshops Study?
- (2) What has been paid to date to K.A. Adam and Associates for its work on the study?
- (3) What has been paid to date to R.J. Davey and Associates for its work on the study?
- (4) What has been paid to date to Bowman Bishaw for its work on the study?
- (5) What other persons have received payment with respect to the study, who are they and in each case what have they received to date?
- (6) What further sum has been allocated for the study?
- (7) When will the study be finalised?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) The total consultancy cost to date is \$129 000.
- (2) The combined fee to K.A. Adam and Associates, R.J. Davey and Associates and public participation consultants - Tim Muir and Associates - to date is \$42 000.
- (3) See answer to question (2) above.
- (4) Bowman Bishaw Gorman has so far been paid \$47 000.
- (5) The heritage consultants - Heritage and Conservation Professionals - to date have been paid \$40 000.
- (6) The total remaining consultants' fee is \$21 000.
- (7) The draft strategy plan will go to Cabinet for consideration before being released for public comment.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

41. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Resources Development:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department of Resources Development to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Resources Development has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

42. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Energy:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Energy Policy

and Planning Bureau to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?

- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Energy has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

43. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Energy:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the State Energy Commission of Western Australia to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Energy has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

44. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Primary Industry:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Dairy Industry Authority of Western Australia to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Primary Industry has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

45. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Primary Industry:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department of Agriculture to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?

- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Primary Industry has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

46. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Primary Industry:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Dried Fruits Board to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Primary Industry has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

47. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Fisheries:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Fisheries Department to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Fisheries has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

53. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Employment and Training:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Western Australian Department of Training to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not

prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

54. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Employment and Training:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Office of Education and Training to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

55. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Employment and Training:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the State Employment and Skills Development Authority to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

56. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Sport and Recreation:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Ministry of Sport and Recreation to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

57. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Sport and Recreation:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Aboriginal Sport and Recreation Foundation to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?

- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

58. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Sport and Recreation:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Western Australian Institute of Sport to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

59. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Attorney General:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Ministry of Justice to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

72. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Community Development:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department for Community Development to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

Answer provided by the Minister for Community Development -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

73. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Labour Relations:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department of Occupational Health, Safety and Welfare to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

74. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Labour Relations:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department of Productivity and Labour Relations to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

75. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Labour Relations:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Workers' Compensation and Rehabilitation Commission to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

76. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Works; Services:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Building Management Authority to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?

- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

77. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Works; Services:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department of State Services to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

78. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Works; Services:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the State Supply Commission to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

79. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Multicultural and Ethnic Affairs:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Office of Multicultural Interests to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

80. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Police:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Police Department to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Police has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

81. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Police:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Police Licensing and Services to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Police has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

82. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Emergency Services:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Bush Fires Board to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Emergency Services has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

83. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Emergency Services:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Western

Australian Fire Brigades Board to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?

- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Emergency Services has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

84. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the Department of Planning and Urban Development to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and the Minister for Planning has indicated that he is not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, the Minister will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

85. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the State Planning Commission to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The information sought would require considerable research and the Minister for Planning has indicated that he is not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, the Minister will be pleased to respond.

MEDIA ORGANISATIONS - GOVERNMENT PAYMENT

87. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Finance representing the Minister for Housing:

- (1) Since 16 February 1993 what funds have been paid by the State Housing Commission (Homeswest) to in each case Channel 7, Channel 9, Channel 10, *The West Australian*, *Sunday Times*, community newspapers, Golden West Network and *The Australian*?
- (2) What is the amount contracted in each case to the above media organisations to be paid that has not yet been paid?

Hon MAX EVANS replied:

The Minister for Housing has provided the following reply -

The information sought would require considerable research and I am not prepared to allocate resources for this purpose. If the member has a specific question about funds paid to media organisations, I will be pleased to respond.

"PROSPECT" - PRINTING DETAILS

89 Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Resources Development:

- (1) Who printed the Western Australia's International Magazine of Resource Development, *Prospect*, March-May 1994?
- (2) What was the cost?
- (3) If State Print was not used, why was it not used?
- (4) If it was not used, was it asked to tender?
- (5) If it was asked to tender, what price did it tender?
- (6) What price was tendered by the printer?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

The Minister for Resources Development has provided the following answer -

(1),(3)-(6)

See answer to question 1231.

(2) \$13 500.

POLICE - OPERATION SWEEP

93. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Minister for Police:

- (1) What was the purpose of Operation Sweep?
- (2) When did it commence?
- (3) Has it ceased, if so, when?
- (4) Has the operation been suspended, if so, when?
- (5) If the operation has ceased, what was the reason for its cessation?
- (6) If the operation has been suspended what is the reason for its suspension?
- (7) What specific directions were given to police officers in Operation Sweep with respect to the apprehension of children?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

I am informed by the Commissioner of Police -

- (1) To maintain law and order within and in the vicinity of the Perth, Fremantle entertainment facilities, Northbridge and central business districts.
- (2) 7 January 1994.
- (3) The operation concluded on 26 February 1994.
- (4) Not applicable.
- (5) Operational decision of the WA Police Force.
- (6) Not applicable.
- (7) Directions were given to police officers that the time of the day,

the location at which a child was found and the prevailing circumstances should all be considered in establishing whether a need existed to take into care any young person until a parent or guardian could be contacted or they could be placed with a Department for Community Development representative.

MESOTHELIOMA - NEW CASES

94. Hon MARK NEVILL to the Minister for Health:

I refer to the article on page 5 of *The West Australian* dated 5 April 1994 and attributed by the author, Brendan Nicholson, to Health Department of Western Australia officials -

- (1) Is it correct that 90 new mesothelioma victims were recorded in Western Australia last year?
- (2) What were the opening and closing dates of the "last year" allegedly referred to by Health Department of Western Australia officers in question (1)?
- (3) How many new cases of mesothelioma were recorded in Western Australia -
 - (a) last financial year;
 - (b) last calendar year; and
 - (c) in the year prior to 16 April 1994?
- (4) Of the 12 victims referred to in the article, who "visited or lived" in Wittenoom -
 - (a) how many lived in Wittenoom;
 - (b) how many visited Wittenoom;
 - (c) what was the length of their residence or visit;
 - (d) when were they residents or visitors to Wittenoom; and
 - (e) how many have died and what was the date of their death?
- (5) How many of the eight women referred to in the article received occupational exposure to asbestos at Wittenoom?
- (6) Of the four men -
 - (a) how many were visitors to Wittenoom;
 - (b) how many lived in the town;
 - (c) for what periods approximately did they live in the town; and
 - (d) were they occupationally exposed to asbestos (ie. did they work in the asbestos mining, milling, or transport industry)?
- (7) If this article is incorrect, what is the latest information in relation to mesothelioma cases among former residents and visitors to Wittenoom?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The article referred to by Hon Mark Nevill - page 5 of *The West Australian* on 5 April 1994 - could not be located. However an article which appeared on 16 April 1994 included the detail referred to by the honourable member.

- (1) Information available to the Health Department indicates that there was a total of 77 mesothelioma cases formally confirmed by the

Mesothelioma Review Committee during 1993. The process of confirmation of a reported case of mesothelioma involves a review of medical information, and obtaining this information is often a lengthy process. Thus, cases confirmed in 1993 include many cases which were originally diagnosed in previous years. The number of cases which have been confirmed by the Mesothelioma Review Committee and were first diagnosed in 1993 is currently 54.

- (2) None of the Health Department's staff authorised to release such information to the media have done so, therefore it is not possible to comment on the "closing" and "opening" dates of the "last year" referred to by the honourable member.
- (3)
 - (a) In the 1992-93 financial year there were 39 mesothelioma cases confirmed. Of all currently-confirmed cases, 54 were originally diagnosed in this period.
 - (b) In the calendar year 1993, there were 77 mesothelioma cases confirmed. Of all currently-confirmed cases, 54 were originally diagnosed in 1993.
 - (c) In the year 16 April 1993 to 15 April 1994, there were 70 mesothelioma cases confirmed. Of all currently-confirmed cases, 36 were originally diagnosed in this period.
- (4) As the Health Department has no information as to the identity of the 12 cases who were referred to in the article as having "visited or lived" in Wittenoom, it is not possible to answer these questions.
- (5) As with (4) it is not possible to answer the question without knowledge of the eight women to whom the article referred.
- (6) As with (4) it is not possible to answer the question without knowledge of the four men to whom the article referred.
- (7) According to the latest available information there have been 35 cases of mesothelioma among former residents and visitors to Wittenoom, who did not have occupational exposure. [See paper No 74.]

MESOTHELIOMA - CASES

John Rush's Claim, Evidence

95. Hon MARK NEVILL to the Minister for Health:

I refer to an article in the *The West Australian* on 6 May 1994 by Brendan Nicholson in which he quotes from uncorrected transcripts relating to evidence given to the Legislative Assembly Select Committee on Wittenoom by Melbourne QC John Rush -

- (1) Is the Health Department of Western Australia aware of any evidence as to the factual basis to Mr Rush's claim that "Western Australia had what could well be the world's highest incidence of mesothelioma"?
- (2) What percentage of the total number of mesothelioma deaths in Australia have been recorded in Western Australia?
- (3) How does this compare with Western Australian percentage of the Australian population?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) Yes. Published reviews of the Epidemiology of Mesothelioma suggest that, amongst jurisdictions that have comprehensive cancer registries, Western Australia has one of the highest incidence rates of mesothelioma.

- (2) According to the most recent information available from the Australian Mesothelioma Register, 14.1 per cent of Australian mesothelioma cases were recorded in Western Australia - 1992 data.
- (3) In 1992, 9.5 per cent of the estimated population of Australia were residents of Western Australia - ABS publication 3201.0.

DEATHS - MESOTHELIOMA, PROSTATE CANCER, BREAST CANCER, RENAL FAILURE, AIDS

96. Hon MARK NEVILL to the Minister for Health:

- (1) What is the death rate in Western Australia in persons per million per year from -
- mesothelioma;
 - prostate cancer;
 - breast cancer;
 - renal failure; and
 - AIDS?
- (2) What portion of each of the above groups are female?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1)-(2) The death rates in Western Australia from mesothelioma, prostate cancer, breast cancer, renal failure and AIDS are shown in the following table -

Crude and age-standardised (ASR) death rates by sex for selected causes, Western Australia, 1990-1992

Cause	Males		Females		Persons	
	Crude rate	ASR	Crude rate	ASR	Crude rate	ASR
Mesothelioma	33	30	7	5	20	16
Prostate cancer	210	170	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Breast cancer	2	2	246	191	123	100
Renal failure	51	41	45	22	48	28
AIDS	40	34	1	1	21	18

Note: Rates are deaths per 1 000 000 person-years.

Explanatory notes

- Deaths have been aggregated into a three year period, 1990-1992, to account for year-to-year fluctuations in the small numbers of deaths from some causes.
- Age-standardised rates have been used to adjust for differences in the age structures of the populations, which are not reflected in the crude death rates. Age-adjustment has involved direct standardisation using the World Standard Population.
- Data on deaths from mesothelioma were extracted from the WA Cancer Registry.
- Source for the death rates for prostate cancer, breast cancer and renal failure was the HDWA mortality database - an abbreviated form of the complete Western Australian mortality database compiled by the Western Australian Registrar General's Office and the Australian Bureau of Statistics.
- Deaths from renal failure include those certified as 'acute renal failure', 'chronic renal failure' and 'renal failure, unspecified'.
- In the absence of a specific cause-of-death code for AIDS and reliable data based on deaths from AIDS-related causes, data on deaths from AIDS

have been extracted from the Western Australian HIV/AIDS Registry maintained by the HDWA.

MINING INDUSTRY - FATALITIES, DETAILS

104. Hon MARK NEVILL to the Minister for Mines:

In respect of the last 50 mine fatalities in Western Australia, would the Minister list for each fatality -

- (a) the name of the person killed;
- (b) the date of the accident;
- (c) the minesite;
- (d) the magistrate who heard the case; and
- (e) whether the magistrate made a finding by inquiry or by inquest?

The answer was tabled.

[See paper No 73.]

ROADS - 8383 EXMOUTH-MINILYA ROAD-BAY OF REST, CLOSURE

107. Hon TOM STEPHENS to the Minister for Lands:

- (1) Was the section of road 8383 extending from Exmouth-Minilya Road to the bottom of the Bay of Rest closed inadvertently?
- (2) If yes, why will the Minister not direct that this section of road be reopened to the public?
- (3) Does refusal to reopen this section of road to the public represent a direct attack on the business interests of Mr Merv Knight of WA Clams, thus preventing the orderly growth of employment generating industry in that area?
- (4) Was the advice given to Mr Knight to seek the approval of the pastoralist for access ill-founded as a pastoralist cannot either grant or deny Mr Knight access on a vacant Crown land reserve?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

- (1) Although the Shire of Exmouth changed its mind in regard to the partial or full closure of road No 8383, council nevertheless resolved to close the road in its entirety and such action has since been gazetted.
- (2) Reopening of the former road first requires the support and resolution of the Exmouth Shire Council as prescribed under the Local Government Act.
- (3) Former road No 8383 would not have wholly assisted Mr Knight in the operation of his mariculture lease to the extent that it never provided continuity of access without an additional requirement for negotiated access across portion of the Exmouth Gulf pastoral lease.
- (4) The pastoralist has the same entitlement as any other land holder to the quiet enjoyment of his lease and can deny access across his pastoral property. Use of the phrase "vacant Crown land reserve" is a contradiction of terms. Neither vacant Crown land nor any reserves are affected by the access route used by Mr Knight.

SUSSEX LOCATION 1362 HAMELIN BAY - DEVELOPMENT PROPOSAL

108. Hon GRAHAM EDWARDS to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

In view of claims by people associated with an application to develop Sussex Location 1362 Hamelin Bay that the application will be approved,

despite being outside council guidelines and despite local objection, because -

- (a) financial donations have been made to the Liberal Party;
- (b) the developers are mates with senior Liberals, including the Minister for Planning;

will the Minister take steps to immediately refute such claims and ensure that any consideration of this proposed development is subject to close and open scrutiny and stringent environmental and planning criteria?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

The Minister for Planning is unaware of the details of ownership or the details of donations to the Liberal Party. As with all applications that are put before the Minister for his consideration, this one will be considered on its merits and in the light of the recommendations of both the State Planning Commission and the local government authority.

ALZHEIMER'S DISEASE RESEARCH INSTITUTE - ESTABLISHMENT, \$1.2M GRANT

112. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Seniors:

The Seniors' Interests policy of the Government prior to the 1993 state election contained a commitment to establish a \$1.2m Alzheimer's Disease Research Institute in the metropolitan area.

- (1) Will the Minister indicate if the present Government intends to provide \$1.2m in order to establish an Alzheimer's Disease Research Institute?
- (2) Would such a project be sited at one of the Western Australian universities, or elsewhere?
- (3) Is the figure of \$1.2m a one-off grant for research?
- (4) If not, over how many Budgets might the \$1.2m be spent?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Seniors has provided the following reply -

(1)-(4) This matter is still being considered.

WESTERN AUSTRALIAN CONSULTATIVE COUNCIL ON ALCOHOL - MEMBERSHIP

113. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Health:

- (1) Who is the Chairman of the Western Australian Consultative Council on Alcohol?
- (2) What is the term of the appointment of the chairman?
- (3) Who are the committee members of the Western Australian Consultative Council on Alcohol?
- (4) What are the terms of the appointment of each member?
- (5) By whom was each person nominated?
- (6) What remuneration is paid to each member and the Chairman?
- (7) When was each member first appointed?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) Mr Dan O'Sullivan, Chairman, Editor in Chief, Perth Newspapers Ltd.
- (2) There was no set term of appointment.

- (3) Specific detail of council membership is tabled. [See paper No 75.]
- (4) There was no set term of appointment.
- (5) Invitations were extended by the former Premier to appropriate liquor industry bodies and the Chief Executive Officers of government agencies.
- (6) The independent chairman is paid an honorarium at the rate of \$4 500 per annum.
- (7) The council was launched 22 September 1992.

MEAT - INQUIRY INTO THE LEVELS OF PESTICIDE RESIDUE IN MEAT REPORT

114. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Primary Industry:

- (1) Is the allegation made by the Shire of Capel principal health officer, Mr Colin Dent, that beef contaminated with pesticides is being sold for human consumption correct?
- (2) Is Mr Dent's allegation that the illegal practice of selling contaminated cattle has been assisted by the inaction of the Department of Agriculture correct?
- (3) What action has the Minister taken to ensure contaminated beef is not made available for sale?
- (4) Is it correct that the Minister has not responded to correspondence from the Shire of Capel on this matter?
- (5) Will the Minister respond to the specific allegation that the Shire of Capel believe they have had sufficient evidence to prosecute several farmers and that these prosecutions have not proceeded due to inaction by the Department of Agriculture?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Primary Industry has provided the following reply -

- (1)-(5) These matters have been addressed by Mr Eric Kelly in his consultancy report, a copy of which I tabled in the House on 10 May 1994.

AMAROO NURSING HOME - GOVERNMENT FUNDING \$1m, DETAILS

117. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Health:

Could the Minister give details of the \$1m he is to provide to Amaroo Nursing Home (*Hansard*, 6 April 1994)?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

On 18 November 1992 the then Minister for Health, Mr Ian Taylor, approved a capital grant of up to \$1m to assist with the construction and fitting out of a 40 bed nursing home in Gosnells. The proprietor of the new nursing home was Amaroo Cottages for Senior Citizens Inc which operates a retirement village and aged persons hostel in Gosnells. On 3 March 1993 the Minister for Health confirmed the contribution by the Health Department of up to \$1m to the Amaroo project. Payment of the grant was subject to the following conditions -

the capital grant was to be no more than \$1m;

the exact amount of the grant would be dependent on the approved final tender price for construction of the nursing home, with the Health Department contributing the difference between the final tender price and the \$1.9m being donated by other parties;

the capital grant would be inclusive of costs associated with the furnishing of the Amaroo nursing home, not to exceed \$100 000;

the Amaroo nursing home would accept up to 40 Mt Henry nursing home residents who wished to transfer to Amaroo. The 40 Mt Henry nursing home beds would also transfer to Amaroo;

in selecting staff, Amaroo would give prior consideration to staff displaced from Mt Henry in consequence of the transfer of the 40 nursing home beds to Amaroo nursing home.

The other financial contributors to the construction of Amaroo were the Commonwealth Government - \$1m, Amaroo - minimum \$0.5m, as per clause 8 of the deed of covenant between the Minister for Health and Amaroo - and the Lotteries Commission - \$0.4m.

The approved final tender price for the construction of Amaroo, which was also the lowest tender, was \$2 855 556. The deed of covenant between the Minister for Health and Amaroo was signed in November 1993, giving a \$1m capital grant towards the cost of construction and fitting out of the Amaroo nursing home. The \$1m included \$44 444 towards the cost of furnishing the nursing home.

ORGANOCHLORINE PESTICIDES - HOME BUILDERS, INFORMED OF HEALTH THREAT

119. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Health:

In relation to an article in the *Journal of Science, Environment and Health* (B27(6), 711-728 (1992) and extensive other published information about uptake of organochlorine pesticides by plants -

(1) Will the Minister ensure that every home builder in the State is fully informed of the potential hazard of organochlorine part B treatments with organochlorine pesticides of buildings under construction, both through exposure to contaminated soil and dust and uptake of the chemicals by plants planted in the external perimeter area of buildings or fowl ranging there?

(2) If not, why not?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

(1) No.

(2) Providing that the organochlorine application has been done according to the Australian standard, there will not be any appreciable exposure which would pose a health risk to home builders. There is no evidence that plants growing in the external perimeter of treated buildings pose a health risk to home builders.

Warnings about fowls are included in the pamphlet 'Pesticide Treatment of Your House' published by the Health Department and required by law to be given to each house owner before any treatment with organochlorines is carried out.

WITTENOOM - ASBESTOSIS, RISK TO VISITORS AND RESIDENTS, HEALTH DEPARTMENT OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA'S CONSIDERATION

120. Hon MARK NEVILL to the Minister for Health:

I refer to the article in *The West Australian* on 15 April 1994 by Brendan Nicholson titled "Wittenoom 'no risk' as asbestosis cases jump" -

(1) Does the Health Department of Western Australia consider current visitors to Wittenoom are at risk of contracting asbestosis?

(2) Does the department consider current residents of Wittenoom who

did not work in the asbestos industry are at risk of contracting asbestosis?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

(1)-(2) No.

MESOTHELIOMA - PAPER BY DE KLERK, N.H. ET AL.
Observed and Predicted Cases, Wittenoom

121. Hon MARK NEVILL to the Minister for Health:

I refer to Figure 5 in the paper by de Klerk, N.H. et al. "Predictions of future cases of asbestos-related disease among former millers and miners of crocidolite (at Wittenoom) in Western Australia" *Medical Journal of Australia*, 1989, vol 151, Dec 4/18, page 616 - in order to compare the observed and predicted cases since 1985.

- (1) In relation to Figure 5, what are the observed number of cases of mesothelioma in each year since 1985?
- (2) What were the predicted number of cases in each year since 1985 or 1986 according to this graph?
- (3) What, as set out in the Table of this paper are the cumulative number of cases of mesothelioma each year since 1986 compared with the predictions in this table?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1)-(3) The numbers of predicted and observed cases of mesothelioma for a cohort of former miners and millers of crocidolite at Wittenoom, Western Australia are presented in the following table. Cumulative totals are also given. The data have been provided by one of the academic research team conducting the study*, Dr Nick de Klerk, who also provided a second set of projections and referred to another published report from the study - Musk et al. 1993. The research team undertook the second set of projections subsequent to the publication in the *Medical Journal of Australia* of the first set - de Klerk et al. 1989. As shown in the table, the numbers of cases observed lie between the numbers predicted by the two sets of projections. As the predictions were based on all cases to the end of 1986, the table includes numbers from the following year, 1987.

*The study is being undertaken by the Department of Respiratory Medicine, Sir Charles Gairdner Hospital and the Department of Public Health, University of Western Australia.

Table Predicted^{1,2} and observed numbers of cases of mesothelioma for a cohort of former miners and millers of crocidolite at Wittenoom, Western Australia, 1987-1993

Year	Predicted cases - assumption 1		Predicted cases - assumption 2		Observed number of cases	
	Number	Cumulative number	Number	Cumulative number	Number	Cumulative number
1987	9.9	9.9	5.3	5.3	13	13
1988	10.7	20.6	5.8	11.1	11	24
1989	11.5	32.1	6.3	17.4	4	28
1990	12.3	44.4	6.8	24.2	7	35
1991	13.2	57.6	7.3	31.5	7	42
1992	14.0	71.6	7.8	39.3	6	48
1993	14.9	86.5	8.3	47.6	13	61

Explanatory notes

- 1 The projections were made according to the status of cohort

members at the end of 1986. At that time, the vital status of 66 per cent of the men and 52 per cent of the women was known. Based on the observed number of cases of mesothelioma to the end of 1986, mathematical models were used to predict the numbers of cases to the year 2020.

- 2 Two sets of predictions have been provided. The first set of predictions - assumption 1 in the table - as reported in de Klerk et al. 1989, assumes that all subjects in the cohort that were lost to follow-up were alive and well and at risk of mesothelioma. The second set - assumption 2 - as provided personally by Dr de Klerk and reported in Musk et al. 1993, assumes that all subjects in the cohort that were lost to follow-up were/are not at risk of mesothelioma.

References

de Klerk N.H., Armstrong B.K., Musk A.W., Hobbs M.S.T. (1989) Predictions of future cases of asbestos-related disease among former miners and millers of crocidolite in Western Australia. *Medical Journal of Australia*; 151:616-620.

Musk A.W., de Klerk N.H., Eccles J.L., Armstrong B.K., Hobbs M.S.T. (1993) Dose-response relationships and predictions for mesothelioma in subjects exposed to crocidolite at Wittenoom, Western Australia. *European Respiratory Review*; 3(11):100-101. [See paper No 76.]

GOATS - ERADICATION SHOOT, COOLAMIA, COST

122. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Primary Industry:

What was the cost of the goat eradication shoot carried out at Coolamia in August last year?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

The Minister for Primary Industry has provided the following reply -

The total cost of the Australian Nature Conservation Agency and Agriculture Protection Board trial on Coolamia nature reserve was \$33 500. The survey costs of \$10 500 were funded by ANCA while the cost - \$23 000 - associated with the removal - helicopter and spotter aircraft hire, ammunition - was funded by APB. The objective of this trial was -

- (1) to estimate the actual feral goat population using a survey-removal-survey method;
- (2) to determine a sightability coefficient for feral goats;
- (3) to determine the effectiveness of a removal technique.

PORT KENNEDY DEVELOPMENT - FLEURIS PTY LTD

Co-participants, Meeting with Minister for Planning

123. Hon J.A. SCOTT to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

- (1) Is it correct that the Minister for Planning has met with the co-participants of Fleuris Pty Ltd in the Port Kennedy development project?
- (2) Who are the co-participants and is the Minister for Planning satisfied with their development skills and financial stability?
- (3) Has Fleuris Pty Ltd paid the Western Australian Government \$500 000 for its share of the Port Kennedy project which was due on the ratification of the project?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) The Minister for Planning has met with Fleuris Pty Ltd and potential investors in the development project.
- (2) As Fleuris Pty Ltd is still negotiating, co-participation arrangements have not been finalised.
- (3) No - see (1) and (2).

ANTI-STALKING LEGISLATION - INTRODUCTION DISCUSSIONS

132. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Health representing the Attorney General:

- (1) Has the Attorney General held discussions with the Minister for Police and the Minister for Community Development in relation to the introduction of anti-stalking legislation?
- (2) Will the legislation be based on the New Zealand system which provides -
 - (a) if a male spouse is charged with assault on a partner twice in two years he is automatically jailed;
 - (b) women are not responsible for pursuing a charge; and
 - (c) advocates are available to support women through the legal system?
- (3) If so, when might the legislation be introduced into Parliament?
- (4) If not, why not?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) Discussions have been held with the Minister for Police.
- (2) Existing legislation in other places including, but not limited to, New Zealand is currently being reviewed to ascertain its relevance to Western Australia.
- (3) The timeline for the introduction of legislation will depend on the nature and complexity of that legislation.
- (4) See (2) and (3).

COMMUNITY SERVICES - PEAK ORGANISATIONS

Public Funding, Government Support

133. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Community Development:

- (1) Does the Government support public funds being made available to peak community service organisations which have the role of representing and speaking on behalf of the less privileged and needy?
- (2) If so, does the Government support public funds being made available to such organisations even if they are required to be critical of government from time to time?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

Answer provided by the Minister for Community Development -

- (1) The Government intends to ensure that funds provided to any community service organisations produce clear, identifiable outcomes and are used efficiently. I have therefore engaged Mr Shane Solomon, a social services consultant, to conduct an independent review of peak organisations and coordination bodies in the community services industry with the following terms of reference -

To identify the current role of each peak organisation and

coordination body, including those representing distinct geographic areas, within the Western Australian community services industry.

To report on the appropriateness and effectiveness of the peak organisations and coordination bodies funded by the Department for Community Development and Office of Seniors' Interests, by referring to their identified roles and any additional achievements.

To recommend any necessary changes to their roles. These should include adequate representation of non-government organisations, communication within the community services industry and planning for service delivery in distinct geographic areas.

When this review is complete I will review how funds which currently support peak bodies are to be used.

- (2) Decisions about the funding of peak bodies will not be influenced by the fact that they may at times be critical of government.

COMMUNITY SERVICES - PEAK ORGANISATIONS

Review, Results

134. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Community Development:

When will the results be known of the review being undertaken into peak community service organisations?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

Answer provided by the Minister for Community Development -

It is anticipated that the report of the review will be presented to the Minister for Community Development by the end of May 1994.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, DEPARTMENT FOR - FAMILY CRISIS PROGRAM

Expenditure, Under Budget

135. Hon CHERYL DAVENPORT to the Minister for Transport representing the Minister for Community Development:

- (1) Is expenditure on the family crisis program under-budget?
- (2) If so, by how much?
- (3) Have these savings been reallocated?
- (4) If so, how will such funds be used?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

Answer provided by the Minister for Community Development -

- (1) Yes.
- (2) Approximately \$863 000.
- (3) No.
- (4) Not applicable.

LANDCORP - "PERTH WESTERN AUSTRALIA - A WEALTH OF RESOURCES", SPONSORSHIP

137. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Lands:

- (1) To what extent has LandCorp contributed financially or in any other way to the publication "Perth Western Australia - A Wealth of Resources"?

- (2) What were the objectives in LandCorp's decision to sponsor this publication?
- (3) To what extent have any such objectives been met?
- (4) How many copies of this publication were acquired by LandCorp and what was the cost of them?
- (5) How many copies are currently still held by LandCorp?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

- (1) \$25 000.
- (2) To increase the awareness of the Joondalup City Centre project among a broad range of decision makers in Western Australia, Australia and overseas.
- (3) It is difficult to quantify the results. However, the publication has been very well received.
- (4) 500 copies at no additional cost.
- (5) Approximately 200.

ELLENBROOK ESTATE - DEVELOPERS, FINANCIAL STATUS
Bushland Listing on National Estate Register

142. Hon J.A. SCOTT to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

- (1) Is the Minister aware of the listing of a large area of bushland in and around Ellenbrook on the register of the National Estate by the Australian Heritage Committee?
- (2) Will the Minister now review any developments proposed for the listed areas?
- (3) Is the Department of Planning satisfied that the developers of the Ellenbrook Estate are on a sound financial footing?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) The Minister for Planning is not aware of the listing of a large area of bushland in and around Ellenbrook on the Register of the National Estate by the Australian Heritage Commission. The Minister for Planning is aware, however, that the Australian Heritage Commission has received a nomination for an area of Ellenbrook. In this regard the Australian Heritage Commission advised the Department of Planning and Urban Development by letter dated 3 December 1992 that an area of Ellenbrook had been nominated to the Register of the National Estate.
- (2) No.
- (3) Planning matters are decided independently of the ownership of the land, and hence it is not appropriate that the Department of Planning and Urban Development assess the financial standing of landowners.

QUESTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

NATIVE TITLE ACT - HIGH COURT CHALLENGE

37. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Leader of the House representing the Premier:

I have given notice of my question.

- (1) What stage has the state challenge to the Commonwealth Government's Native Title Act 1993 reached?
- (2) What legal fees have been incurred by the state to date?

- (3) What is the estimate of the legal fees to be incurred by the state to complete the litigation?
- (4) What is the basis of the estimate?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

I thank the member for some notice of this question, to which the Premier has provided the following reply -

- (1) Chief Justice Mason has conducted a number of directions hearings to date and issued a decision on 13 May 1994 determining the questions to be argued in the hearings set down for September 1994. The state has supplied supplementary material to the High Court arising from these directions hearings.
- (2) As of 31 May 1994 an amount of \$201 177.65 has been paid to outside counsel assisting, in conjunction with the Crown Solicitor's Office, with the High Court challenge to the Native Title Act.
- (3) The legal cost of the High Court challenge could run into millions of dollars. An initial allocation for the challenge will be made in the 1994-95 Budget and will be available with the Budget papers.
- (4) The estimate for 1994-95 represents the best available estimate given the manner in which the case has proceeded in the High Court to date but may need to be supplemented depending on how the litigation is ultimately conducted.

SCHOOL BUSES - PORT HEDLAND

Picket Line, Government Action

38. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Education:

The Minister released a statement on 29 May 1994 indicating that a compromise arrangement would be arrived at to solve the impasse he has created with the parents of schoolchildren using school bus services in Port Hedland.

- (1) Can the Minister inform the House how details of this compromise arrangement will be communicated to the parents?
- (2) What mechanism has the Minister put in place to receive parental feedback on his compromise arrangement?
- (3) If the picket line is not lifted on Wednesday morning, what action does the Minister intend to take to ensure bus services return to normal for the children at Port Hedland?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

- (1) I understand the information was conveyed in a letter from the Director General of Education to the principals of the Port Hedland schools involved, with a request that they convey that information to the parents.
- (2) I presume the feedback will come from the parents advising principals in the schools and me by letter and phone as they have been doing for a while on this issue.
- (3) I will wait and see what happens at the end of the week.

SCHOOL BUSES - PORT HEDLAND

Picket Line, Government Action

39. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Education:

In the same press statement the Minister said he would cancel bus services forever on Wednesday morning if the picket line was not lifted. Does he intend to carry out his threat?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

A typographical error was contained in the press release and that was conveyed to the media. The date was correct, but the day was wrong. The press release referred to Wednesday, 3 June, but it should have been Friday, 3 June. I will decide what to do about this matter when the time comes.

**KING, MATTHEW - FREEHOLD LAND CLEARING BANS,
COMPENSATION**

40. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Education representing the Minister for the Environment:

Some notice has been given of this question.

- (1) What progress has been made towards fulfilling the commitment the Minister has made to compensate Kūkērin farmer Mr Matthew King for freehold land that he is not permitted to clear because his application to clear was refused on environmental grounds?
- (2) Has a level of compensation been agreed?
- (3) Will the compensation be paid under the Soil and Land Conservation Act; and, if not, which Act will be used to permit compensation to be paid?
- (4) Which Act facilitated the payment of compensation for land subject to clearing bans in the Wellington catchment area?
- (5) How was the value of land determined for the purpose of compensation for prohibition of clearing freehold land in the Wellington catchment area?
- (6) Will the same or a similar formula be used in respect of the land owned by Matthew King?
- (7) Is other land being considered for compensation as a result of the imposition of clearing bans?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

I thank the member for notice of this question. The Minister for the Environment has provided the following reply -

(1)-(3)

The offer made to Mr King was to purchase the land to add to the conservation estate. No offer of compensation has been made. However, a number of alternative plans are under consideration by Mr King as to the fate of the land.

(4) Part IIA of the Country Areas Water Supply Act 1947.

(5) The value of land for payment of cash compensation under the aforementioned Act is assessed by the Valuer General's Office in accordance with the criteria set out in the "Guidelines for Compensation Procedure", which I will table at the conclusion of my answer. If purchase of land is involved, the Valuer General's Office assesses a fair market purchase price for the land based on recent sales evidence for comparable areas of land.

(6) Mr King's proposal is different from the Wellington catchment issue. He has been prevented from clearing his land for the conservation of flora and fauna. Arrangements over ownership and management of Mr King's bush are yet to be finalised with Mr King.

- (7) Government policy is yet to be determined with regard to compensation as a result of the imposition of clearing bans.

[See paper No 72.]

SCHOOL BUSES - PORT HEDLAND

Fares Decision; Footpaths and Cycleways, Upgrade Funding; Albany Fares

41. Hon JOHN HALDEN to the Minister for Education:

- (1) Given the Minister's determination to push ahead with the imposition of school bus fares on students in Port Hedland, is he prepared to provide State Government funds to assist the Port Hedland council to upgrade the footpaths and cycleways in the town?
- (2) Is the three year moratorium on school bus fees which the Minister proposes for Albany another example of this Government providing more funds to schools in Liberal electorates than in Labor electorates?

Hon N.F. MOORE replied:

(1)-(2)

The decision to charge full fares in Port Hedland was made by Dr Carmen Lawrence when she was Minister for Education and it was followed up by a further determination by her successor, Dr Gallop, who confirmed that the normal regular passenger transport charges should apply in Port Hedland. For a variety of reasons that decision was not put into effect. I suggest that was after some political pressure from the member for Pilbara and I am sure he would acknowledge that.

Hon John Halden: Hon Phil Lockyer is not doing much for you, is he?

Hon N.F. MOORE: Having had a moratorium for four years a decision has been made that the time has come for those fees to be charged so that Port Hedland is brought into line with other areas in the State with the exception of Albany in respect of charges under the RPT system.

The question of providing assistance to South Hedland for improvements to its road and footpath systems was discussed by a deputation from Port Hedland which recently met with the Premier, a number of other people and me. I hope that in the foreseeable future some progress can be made. The promise to do that was made by the previous government and very little actually happened. The Government is concerned about South Hedland and it will do something about it in its term of government if my understanding of the situation is correct.

The situation in Albany is that an RPT service for students in, I think, the Little Grove area - I could be corrected on that - is about to be implemented. Those students are a bit like the students from the Wedgefield industrial area in South Hedland, where the only access to their school is along a major road. The students in that area of Albany will be exempt from paying the 50¢ fare for three years until such time as an effort is made to improve the safety of that access to their school. A similar situation is applying in Albany as applied in Port Hedland; that is, a period of time was set aside for problems to be resolved. Port Hedland was treated in exactly the same way as Albany is now being treated. It can be demonstrated that there are safety issues like those at Wedgefield applying to the students in Albany, so a fee exemption will be granted until such time as a safe access can be provided to their school.

MINING INDUSTRY - FATALITIES, SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS

42. Hon B.K. DONALDSON to the Minister for Mines:

I have given some notice of this question. I refer the Minister to a recent publication by the Department of Minerals and Energy entitled "Fatal and

Lost Time Injuries in Western Australia", and ask, do the statistics show that safety is improving within the mining industry in Western Australia?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

I thank the member for some notice of this question. There has been a significant reduction in lost time accidents for the past year in the state's metalliferous mines. The number of lost time injuries per 1 000 workers has dropped from 37 in 1992 to 29 in 1993, an improvement of 22 per cent, while in underground mines the rate has fallen from 66 in 1992 to 40 in 1993, which represents an improvement of 39 per cent. The number of work days lost per million hours worked fell from 226 in 1992 to 179 in 1993 for surface mines, while in underground mines there was a drop from 598 in 1992 to 416 in 1993, which represents an improvement of just over 30 per cent.

There was, however, regrettably an increase from six people in 1992 to seven in 1993 in the total number of deaths within the industry. As has been mentioned in the House previously, late last year I set up a working party to review the state of industry fatalities, and to examine initiatives and incidents from Western Australia as well as from interstate and overseas. I expect that working party to report to me soon about what improvements can be made in that area. The Government will continue to work with employer and employee groups to reduce this statistic, with the only satisfactory result a zero death rate.

The Department of Minerals and Energy has done an excellent job in promoting safety awareness within the mining industry through mine inspections, safety workshops, and general promotion of safety aspects through its many publications and advertising materials, and will continue to aim to improve the safety standards throughout Western Australia. It is worth noting that at present, injury rates within this state are almost half the national average, while productivity is at the highest level of all states. I commend the work of the officers of the Department of Minerals and Energy, and the previous government, for their efforts to increase safety within the mining industry, and as Minister for Mines I will ensure that this Government does all it can to create a standard of excellence in mine safety that will be the benchmark for the world to follow.

MEDIA CONSULTANTS - GOVERNMENT APPOINTMENT FOR MID-WEST REGION

43. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Leader of the House representing the Premier:

- (1) Has the Government appointed a consultant to meet Government media needs in the mid-west?
- (2) If yes -
 - (a) What is the name of the consultant?
 - (b) Will the consultant work from a government office?
 - (c) Will the consultant assist the local members of Parliament with their media statements?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

I thank the member for some notice of this question. The Premier has provided the following reply -

- (1) Yes.
- (2) (a) Brian Abbott Media Services.
- (b) No. The consultant will work from an office established in his own home.

(c) His duties were set down in the original advertisement.

ROAD TRAINS - PILOT TRIAL, SWAN SHIRE

44. Hon N.D. GRIFFITHS to the Minister for Transport:

- (1) Can the Minister state the number of road trains which have travelled in the Shire of Swan during the pilot trial period?
- (2) Has the pilot trial of road trains in the Shire of Swan been extended?
- (3) If yes, for what period?
- (4) If yes, was the Shire of Swan consulted?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

- (1) I am not aware of the specific number of road trains as of today, but I know that as of a couple of weeks ago it was in the vicinity of 20 to 30. That has been an improvement on the situation in the beginning, when there were only one or two road trains. Since then, permits have been granted to a number of operators, and that has led to a significant increase in the number of movements of road trains.

(2)-(3)

There has been an extension of the pilot trial period, as has been publicised, for at least another six months in order to provide proper time for evaluation of the operation of road trains in that area.

- (4) The Shire of Swan was advised about the extension. It was consulted initially, and I met with the shire on a number of occasions, and the point was made that until such time as a number of road trains had gone through the trial, no-one would be in a position to evaluate the situation.

I must make the point that on all occasions, I have acknowledged that that section of Great Northern Highway, which is single lane highway, is a problem for all traffic, not just for road trains. The Swan Shire Council, and everyone who uses that section of road, knows that it should be a dual carriageway. However, the Opposition's mate and mine in Canberra does not see fit to provide money for national highways. It is his responsibility. The Federal Government made the decision that it would be totally in control of funding for national highways.

Hon John Halden: In agreement with the states.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Not in agreement with anyone. National highways are the sole responsibility of the Federal Government. We want to see a new highway. It is also worth mentioning at this time, just to confirm that lack of funding, that the federal Minister for Transport came to Western Australia and gave a grandstand performance about giving \$3m for Greenmount, yet I understand - and it is months late in being confirmed - that Western Australia's road funding allocation this year will be less than what we received last year. Therefore, we will have to take \$3m off something else in Western Australia and put it towards Greenmount. That is a nice performance, which is totally consistent with what happened when our friends across the Chamber were in power. They got a reduction every year and said nothing about it. They copped it sweet. They said, "We love you, federal Labor Party." That is why we had a reduction right throughout that period, with the exception of one year when for a political reason there was an increase.

The PRESIDENT: Order! What happens is that you start getting into an argument about something that has nothing to do with the question that the member has asked. We can put up with a bit of deviation, but to get on to an entirely new subject is beyond comprehension.

COASTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN - DRAFT STATE COASTAL POLICY

45. Hon A.J.G. MacTIERNAN to the Minister for Health representing the Minister for Planning:

I have given some notice of this question.

- (1) Does the Government have a coastal management plan?
- (2) If yes, when will the Minister release this plan?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

I thank the member for some notice of the question.

- (1) A draft state coastal policy is currently being prepared.
- (2) The draft policy will be released for public comment once the Government is satisfied with its content.

PERTH AIRPORT - FEDERAL SALE, STATE PURCHASE PROPOSAL

46. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Transport:

- (1) Does the Minister support Hon George Cash's proposal that the Western Australian Government buy Perth Airport?
- (2) Is it the policy of the Western Australian Government to purchase Perth Airport from the Federal Government?
- (3) Can the Minister explain the contradiction between the Government's approach of selling off to private enterprise sections of the Public Service and then proposing to purchase Perth Airport?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

- (1)-(3) Firstly, the Federal Government has announced that it intends to sell off the federal airports around Australia, subject to allowance by the Australian Council of Trade Unions and the Labor Party. Therefore, the Federal Government is unsure of the situation: It has floated the idea to all interested parties, although it is unaware whether it can proceed with the plan. It would be a good thing if the Federal Government were allowed by its superiors to govern and to make a decision. The question was asked of Hon George Cash regarding the future of Jandakot Airport. At that time he made the point that we do not know what the Federal Government will do with Jandakot. We heard the announcement by the Federal Government that the capital city airports may be up for sale, and the State Government wanted to ensure that Western Australians owned the airport if it were sold; that was the point to which Mr Cash was referring. The member knows what he said; the transcript is before him. I agree with him absolutely.

Hon John Halden: Somebody call Richard - there is a problem!

Several members interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order!

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: When the Leader of the Opposition is in deep trouble, he must laugh - otherwise he would cry.

Yes, I agree with Hon George Cash. We have made that statement, and Mr Cash confirmed what we are about on radio. If the airport is to be sold, we want to ensure that it is owned by a Western Australian, although not necessarily by the Western Australian Government. We want to ensure that places like Kununurra, Broome, Port Hedland and Exmouth will receive money as a result of the profitability of Perth Airport for the benefit of Western Australia. We thought members opposite would support that notion.

RAILWAYS - NORTHERN PASSENGER RAIL SERVICE

Overcrowding

47. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Transport:

- (1) Is he aware of the overcrowding that occurs almost daily on Perth's northern passenger rail service?
- (2) Is he aware that today passengers were forced to wait in inclement weather for two or three trains before being able to board?
- (3) As this service carries more passengers than all the other metropolitan services combined, when will the Minister stop procrastinating and provide sufficient trains for commuters?
- (4) When will the Government be purchasing more carriages for the Perth rail system?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON replied:

- (1)-(4) When this Government can get back a little more of the money spent by the previous government -

Hon John Halden: Wind him up again and he gives the same answer!

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: And the Opposition members come in like suckers every time - I cannot believe it!

Hon John Halden: The Liberal Party is the sucker as it has you.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: The people of Western Australia are paying \$34m a year in interest on what is owing for the northern suburbs railway.

Hon John Halden: Do you want to close it?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Members opposite are pretty good with the old Bankcard. No worries! In government they could not use the cheque book because the cheques would have bounced; they used Bankcard so that they did not have to produce the money.

Hon Kim Chance: Did you have a look at your last Budget?

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Did the member see what we did? We created confidence and action in Western Australia, and did not just clock up debt like the previous government did for 10 years.

Hon Graham Edwards: You are about punishing the people of the northern suburbs for having the railway line.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: We do not have to punish the people of Western Australia; the member punished them almost into submission when he was Minister.

Several members interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order! I will cease questions without notice if members are not interested in listening to the answers.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: The Government's first responsibility is to ensure that the cost to taxpayers is not increased, and that is why we are reducing debt.

Regarding the number of passengers who are standing or not finding the best comfort on the trains, that is the price we pay for not properly planning the system in the first place. Importantly, it is tremendous that a large number of people are using the northern suburbs line and the electrified rail system.

Hon John Halden: You can thank a Labor government for that.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: Do I have to say it again?

Several members interjected.

The PRESIDENT: Order! The Minister must answer the question and he should not answer interjections.

Hon E.J. CHARLTON: I am finding it difficult to answer the question as a result of the interjections. I need your absolute protection, Mr President, to cope with members opposite.

We are taking action to ensure that people in the northern suburbs have a quality service not only now but also in the future. The fact that a number of people are standing on the trains demonstrates the efficiency with which the Government is running the public transport system.

BOAT TORQUE - "SUPERCAT CRUISERS" REGISTRATION, ABUSE OF SYSTEM INQUIRY

48. Hon SAM PIANTADOSI to the Minister for Fair Trading:

- (1) Is the Minister aware that an employee of a company called Boat Torque has registered the name "Supercat Cruisers", effectively blocking the actual owner of the Supercat, a competitor of Boat Torque, from using this name?
- (2) If not, can the Minister please investigate this abuse of the system where the clear intent is to harm a competing business?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

- (1) No.
- (2) I am not sure that I agree with the conclusions drawn by the member, but I will investigate the matter.

CONCRETE BATCHING PLANT, NEERABUP - CONSTRUCTION AND OPERATION RIGHT

49. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Lands:

Some notice of this question has been given. I refer the Minister to his answer to question without notice 21 in which he answered no to my question about whether a Crown lease had been granted to allow the construction and operation of a concrete batching plant at Quinns Road, Neerabup.

- (1) If no Crown lease has been granted for the purpose of constructing and operating a concrete batching plant at this site, has some other form of licence, right of entry or permissive occupancy been granted for this purpose on the site?
- (2) If so, to whom was the right granted?
- (3) What are the conditions, rent and fees payable, and the length of time of the application of the right?
- (4) When did this right become effective?

Hon GEORGE CASH replied:

I thank the member for some notice of this question.

- (1) No. However, an offer of a lease was made on 8 October 1992 for a term of 10 years subject to clearance being received from all relevant authorities, including the Department of Conservation and Land Management. Those clearances have only recently been received such that the lease documents may now be finalised.

(2)-(4) Not applicable.

HOSPITALS - SIR CHARLES GAIRDNER
Cost Increases, Supply System Changes

50. Hon KIM CHANCE to the Minister for Health:

Some notice of the question has been given.

- (1) Is he aware of a media release by the Liquor, Hospitality and Miscellaneous Workers Union in which its secretary, Ms Helen Creed, pointed to increased costs as a result of the implementation of changes to the supply department at Sir Charles Gairdner Hospital?
- (2) Is the example given in the media statement accurate that adhesive tape which previously cost \$1.84 now costs the hospital \$5.45?
- (3) Is the Minister aware of the scope of the cost increases on other commodities purchased by the hospital under the altered supply system?
- (4) Is it correct that the changes to the supply system are as a result of the implementation of recommendations made by consultants, Booz-Allen, which was paid \$2m?
- (5) Can the Minister advise whether he intends to order an investigation into the effects of the implementation of the recommendations?

Hon PETER FOSS replied:

(1)-(5) I have a slight knowledge of the matter. I have with me a media release issued by Sir Charles Gairdner Hospital, and perhaps the best way to deal with the question is to read the release -

Sir Charles Gairdner Hospital has rejected Union claims that the current review of operations is resulting in cost increases rather than achieving savings.

The Hospital's Chief Executive Officer, Dr Jon Mulligan, said today the review was expected to achieve several million dollars in recurrent savings, and significant progress has been made towards achieving this aim.

Dr Mulligan said that the Australian Liquor, Hospitality and Miscellaneous Workers' Union was continuing to mislead the public with a campaign of deliberate misinformation about the review outcomes.

"A significant impediment to achieving the implementation of effective reforms which would deliver substantial cost savings has been this Union's continued campaign of obstruction," Dr Mulligan said.

"This opposition is to changes which have been developed in consultation with staff."

I pause for explanation. The Miscellaneous Workers Union was invited to be involved in consultations about these changes and its representatives have continued to walk out of those consultations, despite the hospital management trying to consult with them. When the hospital went ahead with implementing the changes in any event, the union immediately put in place work bans and the matter has ended up in the Industrial Relations Commission. I think the behaviour of the union has been totally destructive and quite regressive.

Hon Kim Chance: Obviously the commission does not, because it came down on the union's side.

Hon PETER FOSS: No. It is unfortunate that the union has continually walked away from opportunities to consult. The media release continues -

Dr Mulligan said the Union was now choosing to target the Hospital's plan to streamline the supply system.

"With the new decentralised ordering system now undergoing a trial in some areas items required by wards and other departments will be delivered directly to where they are needed rather than being kept in a central store."

"This will achieve considerable savings by reducing double handling and releasing funds that have been previously, tied up in maintaining a central supply. There will also be less requirement for warehouse space," he said.

Dr Mulligan said some items outside the current stationery contract had been charged at higher prices than previously but the Hospital had already brought this to the attention of the supplier and the matter was being addressed.

The essential point is that once it is put in place it will reduce the amount of handling and the amount that is being spent on storing these supplies. As a result, the amount that is being paid for either of these things will be exactly the same as before. What has been done by the union in this case is the usual misleading and misinformation that we have struck all the way along with this union.

Hon Kim Chance: It is not misleading. I have the invoices.

Hon PETER FOSS: The union has attributed it to the change in work practices. It has absolutely nothing whatsoever to do with work practices. The union is picking a contract where there was an extra charge which had nothing whatsoever to do with the changes that were implemented. The misleading information comes about by virtue of the fact that the union is saying, "This is inherent in the system changes." It is not inherent in the system changes. The amount which has been paid for certain items will return to the proper amount. But, more importantly, millions of dollars will be saved for our health system. We all know, as do the people at Sir Charles Gairdner Hospital, that they do need world benchmarks and Australian benchmarks in their work practices. If those work practices are brought into line, money will be spent on the health of Western Australians which is being needlessly wasted at the moment.
